

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING  
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN  
COUNTY OF ESSEX  
April 7, 2016

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on April 7, 2016 at 7:34 P.M. in Town Hall.

Chairman Gadsden opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

Attorney Falcon administered the Oath of Office to Elizabeth Wanga.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Mrs. Canfield, Mr. Frenkel, Chair Gadsden, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Kirshenbaum, Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. McNett arrived at 8:04.

ABSENT: Richard Metsky

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Christopher H. Falcon, Historic Preservation Consultant Barton Ross and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve the minutes of the March 3, 2016 meeting as submitted, seconded by Elizabeth Wanga and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

**MEMORIALIZATIONS**

Approval of Application #365, Bryon and Jessica Zirkel-Ruben , 47 Knollwood Road, Short Hills

Upon a motion by Andrew Kirshenbaum to approve Application #365 as submitted, seconded by Bill Gadsden and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes  
Mr. Gadsden-Yes  
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes  
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes  
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

**ADVISORY OPINION APPLICATION #369**

Application #369  
Block #2206, Lot #1

Applicants: ARS Electric & Christ Church  
66 Highland Ave.

Alex Strashinsky, Licensed Electrician, 149 Bee Meadow Parkway, Whippany, NJ.

The property is a designated site located in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

Applicants seek to install seventeen 4'-0" high bollard lights at the parking lot area.

Alex Strashinsky, Licensed Electrician, 149 Bee Meadow Parkway, Whippany, NJ was sworn in.

Mr. Strashinsky presented a sample of the bollard lights. He explained the need for lights due to the safety of the surroundings.

Mrs. Gaylord asked about the brightness. Mr. Strashinsky stated 120 watts pointing towards the driveway will eliminate back lighting. She asked if it will interfere with the house behind. The lights will be on a timer, turning off at 10:00pm.

The rear house is owned by the church and is used as a Rectory.

Hearing no further comments or questions, a motion by Alison Canfield to approve Application #369; seconded by Robert Frenkel and with a roll call vote as follows:

- Mrs. Canfield-Yes
- Mr. Frenkel-Yes
- Mr. Gadsden-Yes
- Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
- Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
- Mrs. Wanga-Yes

**REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION #352**

Application #352  
Block #2105, Lot #5

Applicants: Jordan and Pamela. Davis  
40 Park Place

The property is a non-designated site located in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicants propose an addition to the rear of the dwelling with a great room and expanded kitchen.

Mr. Frank Rawding, Architect, 141 Morris Street, Morristown, NJ was sworn in.

Mr. Rawding, referring to plans by Judd Brown Associates. Three changes are being proposed on the original plan.

Rear elevation had an arch window above the fireplace. They are requesting to remove it to add a wall unit above the fireplace. The side elevation will be changed to have side lights instead of two double hung windows on either side of French doors. Remove a double hung window over the kitchen sink and replacing it with a stove and hood.

Mr. Ross commented that the changes fit well.

Hearing no further comments or questions, a motion by Robert Frenkel to approve Application #352; seconded by Alison Canfield and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes  
 Mr. Frenkel-Yes  
 Mr. Gadsden-Yes  
 Mrs. Gaylord-Yes  
 Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes  
 Mrs. Wanga-Yes

**REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION #340**

Application #340  
 Lot #9, Block #2110

Applicant: Key Compton  
 15 Wells Lane, Short Hills

This property is a designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The Applicant seeks an Amendment to a previously approved Resolution for a new two story addition at the right side and rear of the house to include a new wraparound porch and other window and door alterations.

Key Compton 15 Wells Lane, Dave Rosen, Architect, Rosen Kelly Conway were sworn in.

Referring to the plans, Mr. Rosen stated that there have been some revisions to the design after construction has begun.

The space above the garage is now being considered as a bedroom and egress windows were added. Therefore the roofline had to be raised. Two windows were added as a previous request by the HPC.

Upon finding an old photo of the house, it was decided to create a scalloped profile along the porch. The front door will have a glass panel. The Master bedroom will have windows matching the library for uniformity. A storage room is added behind a lattice area.

Window changes in size were explained in detail in the kitchen, sun room, basement, dormer, back bedroom, back door and rear family room.

French doors were added to the master bedroom and living room.

Mr. Rosen added that all changes have been made on the additions to the house. There are no changes to the historical portion of the home.

Mrs. Wanga stated the larger windows make the garage appear to be taking over the house. Mr. Rosen stated that the landscaping will cover the windows. It was questioned why the arch window was changed. Mr. Compton stated it fits with the design element of the room. The interior of the room will have a barrel ceiling to match the arched window giving the room character. Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. Gaylord and Mrs. Canfield agree that the window doesn't blend with the house and is too contemporary. Mrs. Wanga suggested lowering the roof on the garage.

After a discussion with his wife, Mr. Compton agreed to make the changes suggested by the Commission in order to move forward with a Memorialization.

Hearing no further comments or questions, a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve Application #340; seconded by Mary McNett and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes  
Mrs. McNett-Yes  
Mr. Frenkel-Yes  
Mr. Gadsden-Yes  
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes  
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes  
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

**REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 363**

Application # 363  
Blk. #2104, Lot #1

Applicant: Wendy and Brett Prager  
17 Forest Drive

This property is a designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks a two story family room, master bedroom addition, new pool house, entry canopy revision, new front dormer and extension of the main ridge and a new rear bedroom dormer.

Wendy and Brett Prager along with John James, Architect from Maplewood were sworn in.

Mr. James circulated photos. After considering the Commission's comments from the March 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting, Mr. James, referring stated the front entry was revised to incorporate the original smaller columns. The gables on the front dormers were changed. The court yard was eliminated. Four garages were reduced to three. The intrusion of the garage to the front yard was reduced and the style windows were changed on the pool house.

Photo 11 which is a view from forest drive and photo 12, a view from the evergreen trees were introduced.

Mr. Ross feels the changes are improvements and the views are mitigated as you walk around the house. The pool house and pool are difficult to see.

Mrs. McNett had stated the proposal was presented nicely.

Mr. Frenkel questioned the options of the front canopy. Mr. James stated it was difficult to come up with something to match the small columns. It brings continuity to the front resembling the original home.

Mr. Kirshenbaum questioned the dormer's symmetry. Mr. James stated it allows more light into the room.

Mrs. Canfield, Wanga and Gaylord feel the home has a flow, a beautiful job was done and the home will be stunning.

Mr. Ross asked for a clearer presentation on the gable. Mr. James feels their choice is in keeping with the house.

Hearing no further comments or questions, a motion by Mary McNett to approve Application #363; seconded by Karen Gaylord and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes  
Mrs. McNett-Yes  
Mr. Gadsden-Yes  
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes  
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes  
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

**INFORMAL REVIEW APPLICATION # 364**

Application # 364  
Blk. #301, Lot #15

Applicant: Lisa Zhang and David Quinn  
181 Sagamore Road, Millburn

This property is in the Wyoming Historic District. The applicant seeks to construct a new home on vacant land.

Timothy Klesse, Robert Forbes, Architects of Klesse Architects, was sworn in.

Referring to the revised documents, the roof structure was modified. Material Slateline roofing samples were shown by Mr. Klesse. It was agreed that photo samples will be presented at the next meeting. A brick sample was presented.

Mr. Forbes presented photos including lower to upper Sagamore Road. The history of the surrounding homes was explained. A driveway concealed by landscaping was presented.

Mr. Falcon named the exhibits A-1 and A-2.

Mr. Klesse stated the house is compatible to the neighborhood. The roof was hipped for compatibility as well.

Mrs. McNett referring to the third floor dormer asked if it will be used as a bedroom or what is the purpose of the dormer. Mr. Klesse stated this allows headroom access to the third floor and is an architectural element. Mrs. McNett and Mrs. Wanga feel the entrance of the home should have more of a presence.

Mr. Frenkel questioned the location of the dormer. Mr. Klesse stated it is due to the stair placement. Detailed photos of the homes were circulated.

Mrs. Canfield asked the style of the home. Mr. Klesse stated it is a shingle vernacular from David Gibson's original report. Mr. Ross stated the home is a mix of styles. Mrs. Canfield and Mrs. McNett agreed a style should be chosen rather than multiple styles of one house. They suggest Mr. Klesse pick a style and then design the interior.

Mrs. Wanga stated the other homes are balanced and this home feels heavy on the left side and light on the right. Creating a larger dormer will give it more balance giving more weight to the right side. Mrs. Gaylord agrees pushing the massing to the right will make the home not appear as heavy. It was suggested he raise the grade at the front of the house.

Mr. Ross feels while on the right track, it was suggested to decrease the amount of stone. The side entrance does not work. Possibly a wrap around porch should be added. Move some bulk from the sunroom and guest room to the back. The dormer window needs to be adjusted based on the massing. The railings are not balanced and should be changed to one. The two columns present a contemporary design feature that does not fit with the house. The shutters should be reconsidered.

Satisfied with enough feedback, Mr. Klesse and Mr. Forbes agreed to return in May.

**REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 366**

Application # 366  
Blk. #303, Lot #14

Applicant: Mr. & Mrs. Kaplan  
204 Sagamore Road, Millburn

This property is a non-designated site in the Wyoming Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a two story addition and deck to rear of the home.

Daniel Dubinett, Architect and Ari Kaplan, homeowner was sworn in.

Mr. Dubinett gave the history of the home. A proposed family room will be added to the rear of the house with a smaller deck egressed to the back yard. The mass will be added to the back of the house keeping the roofline lower than the front of the house. No variances are associated with this application. Photos of the existing home were circulated.

Cedar shakes will replace the brick on the first floor. An existing portico will have columns added. In keeping with the house, three casement windows with no grills will be changed to match the existing windows. The existing roof made of slate and asphalt will be changed to asphalt shingles.

Mr., Kaplan stated after speaking with a roofer the only area with slate roofing is not repairable and must be removed.

Mr. Frenkel asked if a total slate roof is considered. Mr. Dubinett stated due to monetary reasons it is not possible.

Mrs. Canfield questioned if there is a slate like material they can consider. It may not be a historic house but it is in a historic neighborhood. Removing the slate roof is stripping the character of the house. She would like to see the windows back to the way it should be. Mr. Dubinett stated even though some products simulate slate, it is not convincing. He feels asphalt shingles won't look like slate.

Mrs. Wanga and Mrs. Gaylord agree that divided lights will improve the home.

Mr. Gadsden reminded it is a non designated site.

Mr. Gadsden asked if the addition will be visible from the streets. Chestnut will have a visual of the rear of the home.

It was agreed that drawings will be resubmitted to Mr. Ross reflecting the discussed changes.

Hearing no further comments or questions, a motion by Mary McNett to approve Application #366; seconded by Elizabeth Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes  
Mrs. McNett-Yes  
Mr. Frenkel-Yes  
Mr. Gadsden-Yes  
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes  
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes  
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

**REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 367**

Application # 367

Applicant: John Chrin

Blk. #2014, Lot #13

26 Northern Drive, Short Hills

This property is a non-designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a new breakfast room and stair hall addition with one new bedroom and two enlarged bedroom suites. Interior alterations include bedroom suites, mudroom, master suite, second floor laundry and installation of an elevator.

John Chrin, homeowner was sworn in along with David M. Rosen, Architect.

Mr. Chrin stated a piece of land behind the home is in agreement to be purchased to prevent disturbing the space of the land. They are in the process of a subdivision. Mr. Rosen stated adding the additional property will allow a three car garage. Drawings were circulated.

The history of the home was explained referring to photographs of the front and rear of the house.

The addition was shown in detail increasing the size of a bedroom a larger kitchen, adding a breakfast area will allow a better flow of the house and reworking the guest suite. The plan is to bring in better light and access to the basement using it as a family space. A long term plan is to add an elevator.

Referring to HPC5, the dining room window will change to an opening. The stairs going up will be replaced from the side door.

Referring to HPC-6, the second floor bedroom will have a bathroom and closet as part of the suite. A wing with a guest room, sitting room, bathroom and closet will have an elevator added and laundry.

Referring to HPC-7 the exterior was shown in detail. A shed dormer will be added. The individual dormers will be replaced with shed dormers.

A variance will be required for not meeting rear yard setbacks.

The Commissioners are pleased with the plans.

Hearing no comments or questions, a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve Application #367; seconded by Robert Frenkel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes  
Mrs. McNett-Yes  
Mr. Frenkel-Yes  
Mr. Gadsden-Yes  
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes  
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes  
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

**REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 368**

Application # 368  
Blk. #3004, Lot #6

Applicant: Durso Construction  
126 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

This property is a non-designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a new two story single family house.

Mr. Ross stated an adjournment was requested by the applicant due to a family emergency. The Commission agreed to carry the application to the May 2016 meeting.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

Mr. Falcon stated the Historic Preservation Staff will meet this Tuesday at 9am to coordinate and make improvements on procedures.

Mrs. Canfield announced The Item will be featuring historical homes and give bios of the new Commissioners.

With no further questions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 10:09 PM.

Respectfully submitted,  
Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary