

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
May 5, 2016

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on May 5, 2016 at 7:35P.M. in Town Hall.

Chairman Gadsden opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Mr. Frenkel, Chair Gadsden, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Kirshenbaum, Mr. Metsky, Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. McNett

ABSENT: Mrs. Canfield,

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Christopher H. Falcon, Historic Preservation Consultant Barton Ross and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve the minutes of the April 7, 2016 meeting as submitted, seconded by Andrew Kirshenbaum and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

MEMORIALIZATIONS

Approval of Application #369, Christ Church, 66 Highland Ave., Short Hills

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve Application #369 as submitted, seconded by Elizabeth Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Approval of Amendment to Application #352, Davis, 40 Park Place, Short Hills

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve Application #352 as submitted, seconded by Elizabeth Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Approval of Amendment to Application #340, Compton, 15 Wells Lane, Short Hills

May 5, 2016

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve Application #340 as submitted, seconded by Elizabeth Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Approval of Application #363, Prager, 17 Forest Drive, Short Hills

Upon a motion by Mary McNett to approve Application #363 as submitted, seconded by Andrew Kirshenbaum and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Approval of Application #366, Kaplan, 204 Sagamore Road, Millburn

Upon a motion by Mary McNett to approve Application #366 as submitted, seconded by Elizabeth Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Approval of Application #367, Chrin, 26 Northern Drive, Short Hills

Upon a motion by Mary McNett to approve Application #367 as submitted, seconded by Andrew Kirshenbaum and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

INFORMAL CONCEPT REVIEW APPLICATION #370

Application #370
Block #3102, Lot #4

Applicants: Wilf
66 Minnisink Rd., Short Hills

May 5, 2016

The property is a designated site located in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

Applicants seek to present a conceptual review for alterations at the property.

Mr. Wilf is looking for the opinion of the board before purchasing this home to determine if the commissioners find his request reasonable.

John James circulated photos to the commissioners and gave the history of the house in detail.

Mr. James proposed renovations and expansions to two wings of the house.

A site plan was presented. Mr. James stated it is planned to expand the kitchen and to construct a new family room with additions on the lower floors. A shed will be removed and a green house constructed in its place. A pool house and pool will be added. The basement foundation will be extended and rebuilt under the garage with a storage area.

The first floor alterations were explained in detail. Expanding the roof, a kitchen, butler's pantry, a secondary entry and the back of the house will have a symmetrical family room and a small porch.

The second floor configuration will change a bathroom to a sitting room with a view. An elevator will be installed opposite the back stairs.

The attic level will be one open room with a gable roof and views of the front and back to be used as a child's playroom.

Outside elevations were explained in detail showing adjacent dormers.

The side of the house was presented. Referring to photograph 2, it was proposed that above the garage will be the kitchen with a bedroom above. The stucco walls will remain.

The rear elevation was presented. Two pairs of doors with a window in the center were shown. The dormer on the back will be extended with two small dormers, all maintaining the character of the house.

The existing carriage house will be reused, keeping the exterior the same. The main room will have French doors, the bathroom and kitchen will be upgraded with an elevator. The existing three bedrooms will become two with a sitting room. A dormer will be added to bring light to the bedrooms.

A green house will replace the shed and below it will be a pool and pool house.

Mr. Wilf stated that no trees will be removed. If the pool threatens the old growth, the pool will be made smaller or reconfigured without disrupting the trees.

A multicolored slate roof will replace the asbestos roof.

Mrs. McNett questioned the style of the original roof. Mr. James stated it was a painted wood roof. He feels maintenance would be too difficult and a mutli-colored slate fits the house better.

Mr. James stated the house is within the zoning envelope. A variance may be needed for the height.

May 5, 2016

Mr. Metsky asked for changes over the history of the home. Referring to pictures, Mr. James explained in detail showing his intention to build on the look of the original house.

Mr. Metsky questioned the width of the family room and living room. Mr. James stated the family room would be too small if they did not widen it.

Mr. Metsky and Mr. Frenkel feel the adjustments are exquisite. It revitalizes the house for contemporary living.

Mr. Frenkel feels the home looks great.

Mrs. Wanga questioned the material of the roof addition. Mr. James stated the roof will be copper stating that a slate roof will make it understated. Mrs. Wanga feels the roof does not fit. She questioned the steps to the pool house. Mr. James stated the steps will go down to the pool which will nestle in the back of the yard. The pool will be concealed from the house to keep it from looking too congested.

Mrs. Gaylord applauded the efforts on the house. She questioned in the kitchen addition, whether the fireplace would be removed. Mr. James confirmed the removal.

Mr. Gadsden asked if the Historical Society had earlier photographs. Mr. James stated there were photos and the house was similar to today.

Mrs. McNett suggested Mr. James check with Tom Doty to determine the history of the trees.

Mr. Ross stated this is one of the most important homes in the town. The slate roof needs to be checked to see if the rafters can hold it. Mr. Ross cautioned that it needs to be decided if the elevations follow the Secretary of Interior standards guidelines by differentiating the new elements.

Although there are several improvements, Mr. Ross suggested the chimney brick be different. It needs to be decided if details should match or look slightly different so you can differentiate the new from the old.

Mr. James stated if it is decided to make the house consistent with the wing design of the house, it will be difficult to match the details. Without a dormer there is no light on the third floor. Based on the comments they will return with a scheme that is similar.

Mr. Metsky stated some houses have to be viewed as unique and special. In the case of this house Mr. Metsky feels the details should be replicated.

Mrs. McNett and Mrs. Wanga agree with Mr. Metsky.

Satisfied with enough feedback, Mr. James agreed to return in June.

INFORMAL CONCEPT REVIEW APPLICATION # 364

Application # 364
Blk. #301, Lot #15

Applicant: Lisa Zhang and David Quinn
181 Sagamore Road, Millburn

This property is in the Wyoming Historic District.

Applicant seeks to construct a new home on vacant land.

May 5, 2016

Mr. Timothy Klesse, presented modified plans using the suggestions from previous meetings.

Two exhibits were presented.

Exhibit 1 was presented by Robert Forbes showing a reduced massing. Retaining walls were added and modified. Window styles were changed to double hung.

Exhibit 2 clipped the corners of the dining room and the second floor cantilever was removed.

Mr. Klesse presented examples of homes suggested by Mr. Ross.

Mr. Quinn the land owner stated the land was purchased with the expectation to build a colonial house to fit in the neighborhood.

Mrs. McNett asked if Mr. Quinn's family will be moving in to the house. Mr. Quinn stated that they are.

Referring to photos, Mr. Klesse does not feel that the house should be 1 ½ story building in comparison to existing houses.

Mrs. Wanga stated the outside of house seems to be designed for the inside. The house does not have a specific style and the massing should be a proper fit.

Mr. Ross stated that the house should show similarity to the designated houses on the block rather than compete with them. Mr. Ross feels this presentation is more cohesive to the district although Mr. Quinn is not in agreement.

Attorney Falcon asked for clarification that a new drawing is being presented. Mr. Klesse confirmed.

Mrs. Gaylord suggested extending the dormer and adding a window.

Mr. Gadsden suggested Mr. Klesse discuss the changes with his client and come back next month.

Mrs. McNett suggested extending the dormer will help with the massing issue.

Mr. Metsky agreed with Mr. Ross that there is too much roof on the house proportionally. The turret needs to be brought down and the shed roof needs to be brought up to reduce the height of the roof line. Enlarge the windows to bring in more light.

The entire commission was in agreement with Mr. Metsky's suggestion.

Mr. and Mrs. Vesecky, neighbors at 185 Sagamore, came forward and stated their concern with the size of the home which is next door to them.

With no further questions or comments, Mr. Klesse agreed to submit a formal application and return next month.

REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 368

Application # 368
Blk. #3004, Lot #6

Applicant: Durso Construction
126 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

May 5, 2016

This property is a non-designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a new two story single family house.

Mr. Ross stated an adjournment was requested to allow time to expand the presentation team to include their attorney and an expert in Preservation.

The Commission agreed to carry the application to the June 2016 meeting.

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 9:06 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary

167323