

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING  
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN  
COUNTY OF ESSEX  
June 2, 2016

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on June 2, 2016 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Chairman Gadsden opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

Attorney Falcon administered the Oath of Office to Elizabeth Wanga.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Mrs. Canfield, Mr. Frenkel, Chair Gadsden, Mrs. Gaylord,  
Mr. Metsky, Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. McNett

ABSENT: Mr. Kirshenbaum

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Christopher H. Falcon, Historic Preservation  
Consultant Barton Ross and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve the minutes of the May 5, 2016 meeting as submitted, seconded by Robert Frenkel and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

**ADVISORY APPLICATION # 371**

Application # 371  
Blk. #2201, Lot #1

Applicant: Nettune  
123 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

This property is a designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to replace three dormer windows on the front facade.

Bradley Nettune of 123 Highland Avenue was sworn in. Mr. Nettune, referring to plans, explained the existing dormers and introduced the plans for new dormers.

Questions were opened to the commission; Mr. Metsky asked if the existing dormers are original. Mr. Nettune confirmed. Mrs. Canfield asked if all pillars will be square. Mr. Nettune confirmed. Mrs. Wanga and Mrs. Gaylord stated the windows are too "high style". Mr. Nettune agreed he is open to looking at other options. Mr. Ross will investigate old photos of the home. Mr. Metsky, referring to pictures of similar homes, stated a pediment on top would be preferred. Mr. Ross suggested showing the whole façade at the next meeting.

Mr. Nettune agreed to return next month.

**INFORMAL REVIEW #372**

Application #372  
Block #3104, Lot #4

Applicants: Mehta  
171 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

The property is a non-designated site located in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

Applicants seek to present a conceptual review for demolition and construction of a new single-family house at the property.

BJ Mehta, homeowner and Matthew Rosenbaum, Architect introduced themselves.

Mr. Rosenbaum, referring to the plans, explained the history of the home. Photos were shown of basement flooding, and the walls with cracks, original windows and suspect mold in the basement. They are requesting a new single family home with an open floor plan. Photos of local homes with flat roofs were presented.

Mr. Ross commended the applicants on the design of modern architecture. Mr. Frenkel asked if the property was subdivided after World War II. Mr. Ross confirmed. Mrs. McNett questioned the history of the existing house. Mr. Rosenbaum did not have the history considering this was an informal hearing. Mr. Mehta added that the existing house has many stairs and is not convenient for his family. Mr. Metsky stated after further investigation he feels that the existing house should be considered. Mr. Metsky explained the original architect's history in detail and favored restoration. He asked that Mr. Ross look further into the architecture of this house. Mr. Frenkel stated that most of the shown examples are not in the historic district so the photos don't make sense. He would not envision this house on the property. Mrs. Canfield stated the existing house was contemporary in its time. Materials will be important. Mrs. Canfield is not opposed to a contemporary home. Mrs. Wanga's thoughts were that she is a fan of modern architecture and she believes anything can be restored. The proposal is not nestled into the landscape as the other homes in the area. Mr. Rosenbaum stated the plan is to preserve as many trees as possible. Mrs. Gaylord stated the contemporary home in no way fits into the neighborhood. Regulations were discussed in detail. Mrs. McNett stated there is a contemporary house there, nestled in to the landscape. She feels the diversity of architecture is what makes the tapestry of the district so interesting. The issue is that the proposed plan is not nestled and it pops out. Mr. Frenkel asked if an open floor plan can be created with a different house. Mr. Mehta stated he likes the sunlight and open plan but changes are willing to be made.

Mr. Rosenbaum and Mr. Mehta agreed to return to the July meeting for further discussion.

**REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 364**

Application # 364  
Blk. #301, Lot #15

Applicant: Lisa Zhang and David Quinn  
181 Sagamore Road, Millburn

This property is a non-designated site in the Wyoming Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a new two story single family house.

Mr. Timothy Klesse and Robert Forbes, architects along with home owners Lisa Zhang and David Quinn, were sworn in.

Mr. Klesse presented modified plans using the suggestions from previous meetings. After a neighborhood analysis (A-1) Mr. Forbes presented Site-1 showing how the lots relate showing a wide range of styles and materials. Referring to Lot 9. The new construction will be in a shingle vernacular compatible with different types of houses in the district, marked as Design Examples A-2. A new roofline was presented in detail. The front stairway was moved to put the entrance in

focus. The lower level was shown in detail. Elevations were presented showing the building with less mass. Rear elevations were shown.

Mr. Gadsden opened questions up to the audience. Kathy Visecki of 185 Sagamore stated the homes are not looking as natural. She questioned the landscape of the home. Mr. Klesse stated there is a town tree ordinance. A planting plan will be approved by Mr. Doty. Jennifer Duckworth of 82 Linden Street stated that this is a special property and has not been built on due to its particular shape with a steep slope. Mrs. Duckworth suggested moving the dry well so that trees won't have to be removed. Mr. Klesse agreed to put a dry well in the driveway with permeable pavers in order to leave the trees in place.

Mark Vasecky of 185 Sagamore is opposed to the house because he feels it is on top of his house. The house needs to be narrower going to the back of the hill rather than on the side. Mr. Klesse stated the house is conforming with zoning. Mr. Vasecky stated no other homes on the street have a three car garage. Mr. Klesse stated the three car garage is concealed from the street and conforms to the zoning on that side.

Mrs. Vasecky stated the character of the neighborhood is changing.

Cheryl Burstein of 175 Sagamore is concerned with the width when looking at the house. Mr. Klesse responded he did not like the look of the house and brought the house into the steep slope. Mr. Quinn the applicant stated that the neighbor preferred that the driveway be on his side of the home.

With no further comments or questions from the audience, Mr. Gadsden opened up comments and questions to the commissioners.

Mrs. Canfield agrees with Mrs. McNett that the reason it is asked if the owner will live on the property is to determine what drives the design. In this case they feel the program is driving the design. Mr. Metsky stated the left side of the home is good in terms of breaking down the massing. The right corner, of the dining room should be shifted to the back. This may diminish the overall massing from the street. The articulation and overall composition is very different from left to right. Can the left side be broken down to be similar? Mr. Klesse stated it will lose elements referring to plans. Mr. Frenkel asked the average square footage on the street. Mr. Klesse, referring to photos, called attention to houses larger than the house presented today. Mrs. Canfield agrees with Mr. Metsky and feels the nicest element is the porch on the left. Regarding the trees, Mrs. Canfield stated that Mr. Doty approved removal of non native trees due to disease. Mrs. Canfield suggested Mr. Doty go to the homes and tag non native trees. Mrs. Wanga and Mrs. Gaylord raised the same concerns about the quality of materials and how the details are executed. It was decided that extending the porch would be a good compromise. Mr. Frenkel questioned the square footage of the house. Mr. Klesse gave the measurements in detail. Mrs. Burstein, a neighbor, stated that just because it conforms to zoning, the HPC does not have to agree on the size. Attorney Falcon read the zoning rules and stated that what is being proposed needs to meet a compatibility standard. Materials were presented by Mr. Klesse.

With no further questions or comments Mr. Klesse agreed to return to the July meeting for further discussion.

