

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
July 7, 2016

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on July 7, 2016 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Chairman Gadsden opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Chair Gadsden, Mr. Davis, Mr. Frenkel, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Kirshenbaum, Mr. Metsky, Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. McNett

ABSENT: Mrs. Canfield

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Christopher H. Falcon, Historic Preservation Consultant Barton Ross and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MINUTES:

Attorney Falcon administered the Oath of Office to Zachary Davis.

Upon a motion by Mrs. McNett to approve the minutes of the June 2, 2016 meeting as submitted, seconded by Mrs. Gaylord and with a unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

MEMORIALIZATIONS

Approval of Application #373, Robert and Lenore Rice, 14 Wyndham Road, Short Hills

Mr. Metsky - Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

INFORMAL REVIEW #372

Application #372
Block #3104, Lot #4

Applicants: Mehta
171 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

The property is a designated site located in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to present a conceptual review for demolition and construction of a new single-family house at the property.

Chair Gadsden stated an adjournment was requested. The Commission agreed to carry the application to the August 2016 meeting.

ADVISORY APPLICATION # 371

Application # 371
Blk. #2201, Lot #1

Applicant: Nettune
123 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

This property is a designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to replace three dormer windows on the front facade.

Chair Gadsden stated an adjournment was requested. The Commission agreed to carry the application to the August 2016 meeting.

ADVISORY APPLICATION # 374

Application # 374
Blk. #2110, Lot #4

Applicant: Clark
55 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

This property is a designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to remove and wall off a porch door on the rear facade.

Elizabeth Clark was sworn in and explained the renovations in detail.

Mr. Metsky asked if the metal platform and railing would be removed. Mrs. Clark responded to the Commission's request and stated that she would be willing to do so.

All were in favor of Mrs. Clark's presentation and Mr. Metsky's suggestion.

Attorney Falcon stated he will prepare a resolution conditioned upon the removal of the metal platform and the railing.

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve, seconded by Mary McNett and with unanimous voice vote, the application was approved.

REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 368

Application # 368
Blk. #3004, Lot #6

Applicant: Durso Construction
126 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

This property is a non-designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a new two story single family house.

Chair Gadsden stated an adjournment was requested. The Commission agreed to carry the application to the August 2016 meeting.

REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 364

Application # 364
Blk. #301, Lot #15

Applicant: Lisa Zhang and David Quinn
181 Sagamore Road, Millburn

This property is a non-designated site in the Wyoming Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a new two story single family house.

Chair Gadsden stated an adjournment was requested. The Commission agreed to carry the application to the August 2016 meeting.

REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 375

Application # 375
Blk. #2202, Lot #9

Applicant: Elana and Brett Tanzman
91 Western Drive, Short Hills

This property is a designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a pool house on the property.

Elaina and Brett Tanzman and John James, Architect were sworn in. Mr. Tanzman stated that it would be appropriate to have a pool house due to the distance between the house and the pool.

Mr. James gave details of the colonial revival house. A site plan was presented. The pool house is not visible from the street and can only be seen by the second floor. Proposed location is the only appropriate place to set the pool house level, nestling it within the property. The design will be a cross gable with a kitchenette, laundry and a changing room with a quiet room/study. A full basement will be dug for equipment storage. The elevation will remain the same.

Materials were presented resembling details of the main house. Various views were shown. Photo 1 shows the landscaping and the house. Photo 2 shows the base of the driveway, Photo 3 presents the back of the house. Photo 4 shows the view from a path outside the arbor. Photo 5 shows the view across the pool towards the back yard. Photo 6 shows the location of the pool house.

Mrs. McNett asked about lighting plans. Mr. James stated that low level lighting and wall sconces will be installed.

Mr. Davis asked if there are plans for shutters on the pool house. Mr. James stated there is no room and he would like to keep it understated.

Mr. Metsky, Mr. Frenkel, Mr, Kirsnenbaum, Mrs. Wanga and Mrs. Gaylord feel the plan is a nice addition, is well done and consistent with the ordinance requirements.

Hearing no further comments or questions, a motion by Robert Frenkel to approve Application #375; seconded by Karen Gaylord and with a roll call vote as follows:

- Mr. Davis-Yes
- Mr. Metsky - Yes
- Mrs. McNett-Yes
- Mr. Frenkel-Yes
- Mr. Gadsden-Yes
- Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
- Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
- Mrs. Wanga-Yes

REGULATORY HEARING APPLICATION # 376

Application # 376
Blk. #2203, Lot #5

Applicant: Roger and Linda Nortillo
110 Knollwood Road, Short Hills

This property is a designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District.

The applicant seeks to construct a two-story addition.

Mr Frenkel recused himself.

Dr. Roger Nortillo, Mark Andrews, Architect, Tom Spagnuolo and Doug McCarthy, Contractors, were sworn in.

Dr. Nortillo of 110 Knollwood Rd. stated the Hartshorn house currently has no master bathroom or master closet.

Mr. Andrews, referring to the plans, stated that currently there is a hall bathroom and a small closet under the eaves. On the first floor a game room will be added to support a second floor addition. The existing closet will be enlarged with a high ceiling for extra storage space. The front of the house will have an eyebrow window to let light into the closet. The roofline will be maintained. The material will match the stucco on a dormer as well as the back of the house. The slate roof will match the existing slate and be recycled. Photos presented showed the house is not visible from the street when trees are in bloom. A site plan was presented. The chimney will be extended and will precisely match the existing materials in detail.

Mr. Spagnuolo presented similar stone samples matching the current house.

Mrs. McNett asked Mr. Ross if a distinguishing material should be added. Mr. Ross stated that Mr. Andrews has been in constant contact addressing the concern of making the addition look dramatic and extending the chimney in keeping with a Hartshorn house. It is up to the commission to decide whether bringing this house to something more workable or if this is part of the architecture that can't be lost.

Mrs McNett would like to have a visual roof line and differentiate the material on the addition instead of replicating a Hartshorn house. Dr. Nortillo stated they matched the stone with stucco above to make a distinction and keeping the long roof angle coming down.

The angle of the roof in front and back was created to be able to get into the garage.

Mr. Metsky questioned the history of the house. Dr. Nortillo gave the history of the house. He stated there were additions before the purchase of the house including a pool and a three car garage. Mr. Metsky stated that the composition of the house is beautifully composed and the asymmetry is an important aspect. Mr. Metsky observed for a small addition it looks large due to the roofline. He suggested pulling it back slightly to differentiate it from the main house. Mr. Metsky stated that the composition of the windows could be joined together. The bay window should be squared off to make it feel as though it is integrated. Mr. Metsky stated that the stucco is acceptable as long as the color matches. He stated that lowering the roofline would be helpful. The copper roof is overwhelming. The black panel on the second floor is not suitable. The keystone impediments should not be stucco. From the ground floor, a center window may help compositionally. The side bathroom pops out on the second floor with odd brackets in the back. Mr. Anderson said it is a functional design matching the rear of the house. The pop out allows you to get out of the garage. Mr. Metsky said the issue is more about composition than functionality.

Mr. Kirshenbaum agrees with the idea of simplicity. He asked for Mr. Ross's thoughts on the roofline of the house. Mr. Ross stated that with the design of the house, there is no other option for an addition. The stucco and eyebrow dormers are a good idea. He agrees with Mr. Metsky's idea of moving the windows. Materials clashing is a concern. Matching existing stone is acceptable. The roofline could change slightly.

Mr. Davis stated it is hard to envision the stucco. Dr. Nortillo stated the stucco will be painted to be consistent with the existing house. Mr. Davis asked how high the chimney will extend above the roofline. Mr. Andrews stated four feet.

Mrs. Wanga suggested the addition minimizes the door which is no longer centered. The stucco draws your eye away from the center of the house. Mr. Andrews stated it will eliminate a lot of the space. Mr. Andrews stated the addition is set back slightly. Mr. Andrews stated they are trying to minimize any change in the exterior of the house. Mrs. Wanga stated the roofline should be lowered. Mr. Andrews stated that the mechanical equipment for the first and second floor is being installed in the roofline.

Mrs. Gaylord stated her understanding of the Commission's suggestions. She agreed that the roofline should be dropped down a foot higher than the peak of the original roof.

Mr. Ross noted that the shed dormer on the main roof is also changing to copper to match the detail of the front door. Dr. Nortillo stated it does not need to be changed and he is willing to remove it. The Commission approved of the change.

Attorney Falcon stated if we come to terms with the conditions and Mr. Ross will review the changes in the plans, a Resolution can be done in August.

Attorney Falcon announced the conditions as follows:

1. Lower the roofline of the proposed addition by a minimum of 24";
2. Group together the two windows on the second floor front elevation of the addition;
3. Eliminate the second floor bump out on the rear elevation;
4. Reduce the height of the copper roof over the bay windows on the second floor of the addition between 24" – 36";
5. Pediment material on the second floor window heads shall be revised to bluestone; and
6. The false window frame centered on the second floor of the bay is to be removed and replaced with stucco.

Chair Gadsden and Mr. Ross will be involved in the review of the revised PDF files, together with another Member to be designated by the Chair.

Hearing no further comments or questions, a motion by Mary McNett to approve Application #376; seconded by Karen Gaylord and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Davis-Yes
Mr. Metsky - Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Referring to the Ordinance, Mr. Falcon stated he met with the Chairmen and Mr. Ross last Monday and went over the changes that had been suggested by the Township Committee. Discussions have been incorporated and final changes will be reviewed by the end of next week and it will be presented to the Township Committee for adoption this fall.

Mr. Falcon conveyed that Mr. Ross did a wonderful job in explaining the provisions. The changes that are being made will be circulated.

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 9:17 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary