

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
August 4, 2016

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, August 4, 2016 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Chairman Gadsden opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Mrs. Canfield, Mr. Davis, Mr. Frenkel, Chair Gadsden,
Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Kirshenbaum, Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. McNett

ABSENT: Mr. Metsky

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Christopher H. Falcon, Historic Preservation
Consultant Barton Ross and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve the minutes of the July 7, 2016 meeting as submitted, seconded by Robert Frenkel and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

MEMORIALIZATIONS

Approval of Application #374, Elizabeth Clark, 55 Highland Ave., Short Hills

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve Application #374 as submitted, seconded by Mary McNett and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Davis-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Approval of Application #376, Roger and Linda Nortillo, 110 Knollwood Rd., Short Hills

Upon a motion by Karen Gaylord to approve Application #376 as submitted, seconded by Elizabeth Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Davis-Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

HISTORIC PRESERVAITON COMMISSION MINUTES

August 4, 2016

Approval of Application #375, Elana and Brett Tanzman, 91 Western Drive, Short Hills

Upon a motion by Robert Frenkel to approve Application #375 as submitted, seconded by Elizabeth Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Davis-Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

Mr. Gadsden advised the Commission that the Applicant had filed revised plans following the last meeting which had satisfied all of the revisions set forth as conditions in the memorializing resolution. The Subcommittee appointed by him to review the revised plans had filed a Report with the Commission noting approval of the plans and he had requested that Mr. Ross notify Mr. Jones, the Construction Code Official, that the Commission approved the issuance of permits for construction as depicted in the revised plans.

ADVISORY APPLICATION REVIEW #372

Application #371
Blk. #2201, Lot #1

Applicants: Julieanne Nettune
123 Highland Avenue, Short Hills

This is a Designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District. The applicant seeks to replace three dormer windows on the front façade and driveway.

Chair Gadsden stated an adjournment was requested. The Commission agreed to carry the application to the September 2016 meeting.

REGULATORY HEARING #368

Application #368;
Blk. #3004, Lot #6

Applicants: Durso Construction
126 Highland Ave; Short Hills

This is a non-designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District. The applicant seeks to construct a new two story single family house.

Tom Baio, Architect, came forward and was sworn in, as well as Ira Smith, Architect, and Barton Ross, HPC Consultant.

Mr. Baio stated this is his 9th time appearing with this application. He reviewed his past presentations briefly as well as past feedback from the Commission.

Mr. Baio presented plans for a 5742 square foot house. The roofline shows three dormers. A three-dimensional model was presented of a house with one and a half stories. Views of the house were shown from street angles. The driveway was presented stating that it is difficult to see from the street. Exhibits A1-B, A2-B, A3-B and -A4-B were shown. A non fenced landscape plan was presented with the purpose of shielding the neighbors view from the house.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

August 4, 2016

Ira Smith thanked the Commission. Mr. Smith is previously qualified as an expert in architecture and preservation. Mr. Smith gave details of the stone on the house facing the adjacent Hartshorn House at 120 Highland. The gables and eaves as well as the shed roof were described referring to Exhibit A-2B. The front and rear porches are a traditional design element making the house appear lighter.

The flagpole in the landscape plan will not be constructed.

Mr. Smith, addressing the topics of siting, style and substance, observed that the project had evolved and improved as the result of a patient search for an appropriate design.

Mr. Baio presented material samples of earth colored stone products. Shingles will be of western red cedar with a semi transparent stain. The roof is a treated shake to preserve the color. The windows will be simulated divided glass producing better energy efficiency. The chimney will be designed in brick to distinguish it from the stone.

Mr. Ross stated the designed house has improved greatly over time and is compatible with the designated historic district.

Upon hearing no questions from the public, Mr. Gadsden opened questions to the Commission.

Mrs. McNett asked how important the 6 pillars are. Mr. Ross stated through discussion Mr. Baio agreed to change the pillars to an even amount which is typical of a historical house. Mrs. McNett stated that she feels overall this plan will sit well on the property. Mrs. McNett stated the Commission needs to be more specific. While it is not the best design, if the commission is going to ask for more, specifications need to be made. There seems to be a lack of direction. This is new construction on an oversized lot of and zoning would not look favorably upon changing the zoning guidelines.

Mrs. Canfield stated she agrees with the six columns but is concerned how it lines up with the windows. Mr. Ross suggested shifting the front door. Mr. Ross as well as Mr. Smith suggested a subcommittee.

Mr. Frenkel questioned the significance of symmetry. Mr. Ross and Mr. Smith stated that columns are always in even numbers which goes back to the 1500's. Mr. Frenkel questioned if the vegetation will hide the view. Mr. Baio confirmed.

Mrs. Wanga questioned the gullies between the dormers and the ridge height. Mr. Baio stated the first roof line is long causing the ridge beams to go long. Mrs. Wanga feels the gambrel dormers are oversized and symmetrical. Mr. Baio stated the dormer brings light into the home and the gambrel brings the roof forward. Mr. Smith stated that after digesting the design, he feels the novelty of the dormers will create architecture that is indefinite. This house combines traditional elements with modern architecture. Mr. Ross stated it could be tweaked and added as another condition with the subcommittee. Mrs. Wanga feels the color choices need more differentiation. Mr. Baio stated the trim and window trim will be white. Mr. Baio stated weathering of the natural materials will change the colors. Mrs. Wanga suggested shed dormers should be put in. Mr. Baio replied it is not possible due to the fact that he would have to make it a flat roof. Mrs. Wanga argued that the symmetry is an issue.

Mr. Davis questioned the landscaping and requested views from the street. Mr. Baio explained the landscape plan in detail. Mr. Baio stated any items grabbing attention will be removed (i.e.: flag

HISTORIC PRESERVAITON COMMISSION MINUTES

August 4, 2016

pole). Mr. Davis is not comfortable with the placement of the columns in front of the dining room window.

Mrs. Gaylord excused herself from the meeting, but before leaving, stated that she was happy with the plans.

Mr. Gadsden stated the plans are a solution that he is comfortable with upon a condition of the modification of six columns.

Mr. Smith stated without a specific goal in mind, redesigning the dormers would be difficult to please everyone.

Attorney Falcon stated he will prepare a resolution conditioned upon the asphalt driveway going directly to the grass with no Belgium block. The columns will be changed from five to six columns and no flagpoles or spires on the dormers.

Upon a motion by Mary McNett to approve, seconded by Robert Frenkel and with a majority roll call vote, the application was approved

Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mrs. McNett-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mr. Kirshenbaum-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-No

INFORMAL REVIEW #373

Application #373
Block #3104, Lot #4

Applicants: Vijay Mehta
171 Highland Avenue

This is a Non-designated site in the Short Hills Park Historic District

The applicant seeks to present a conceptual review for demolition and construction of a new single-family house at the property.

Matthew Rosenbaum, Architect stated after a meeting at the site as well as previous comments from the commission, a concept was presented.

The history of the home was presented. The goal is to emulate components of the original house. A home inspection letter explained the structural condition of the home including grading issues and the fact that the chimney was not constructed to code. The chimney condition and decay from water, termite damage and electrical issues were referred to.

The new application preserves components of the original home through the large expansions of glass and the glass entry. It is assumed that the original foundation is damaged. The goal is to keep the same modern style of the existing house. The access down the center of the home will be maintained. The remaining structure will consist of a garage on the main level with an open family room concept which is also connected to the kitchen. The new structure is narrower. The house could be moved further from the adjacent Hartshorn house at 163 Hartshorn, by 6-8 feet.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

August 4, 2016

The floor plan was explained in detail including the front entry. The structure will be terraced up to the rear portion of the property. The positioning of the home on the site is consistent with the existing home.

A hand sketched aerial perspective of the home was presented as well as a street view.

Upon hearing no questions from the public, Mr. Gadsden opened questions to the Commission.

Mrs. Canfield asked Mr. Ross to clarify what was discussed during a subcommittee meeting which she had attended. Mr. Ross stated some problems were evident. The idea of moving the driveway was acceptable by the committee. The main living room was well liked. It was found that the chimney was in poor condition. Mr. Ross said although there was a difference of opinion on the style of the house, the original house was considered modern.

Mr. Mehta passed around information on homes in the area.

Mrs. Canfield questioned the regulations of a three car garage in front. It was clarified by Mr. Rosenbaum that you can't have forward facing doors. Photos of similar materials were passed around. Mrs. Canfield feels a false garage door to blend in with the house would hide the garage since it is in the front. The original Hartshorn houses are all very different in style which leads her to accept the proposed contemporary house. She agrees the house needs to be torn down from an engineering standpoint.

Mrs. Wanga agreed the garage is an issue and should be made smaller. She is pleased with the side elevations.

Mr. Davis stated it is not clear why a modern building would be presented and why was it ever built as a modern home in the 1950's. He feels it should be compatible with the neighboring buildings. The existing style home and the proposed home does not fit within the district. Mr. Ross respectfully disagreed. Mr. Davis stated the advantage is being set back from the road. The vegetation has to work with the building and harmonize with the surrounding homes.

Mr. Frenkel and Mr. Kirshenbaum agree that this house appears as a series of boxes which seem incompatible with the surrounding district.

Mrs. McNett stated that the fabric of the community is important and saving certain elements to the living room is suggested.

Mr. Kirshenbaum prefers a traditional look in keeping with the neighborhood.

Mr. Gadsden suggested that the Commission obtain feedback from the absent commissioners before going forward. Mr. Ross stated Mr. Metsky was open to a modern house, saving aspects of the living room and replicating aspects of the original design elements.

Mr. Rosenbaum stated the contract to purchase the home expires in September.

Attorney Falcon explained the ordinance in detail.

Mr. Gadsden asked how the commission would vote on the issue of the compatibility of the contemporary house presented in relation to neighboring residential structures in the District. A straw poll was taken with a majority of those present, indicating a majority in favor of compatibility for a modern style house.

HISTORIC PRESERVAITON COMMISSION MINUTES

August 4, 2016

McNett - Yes
Wanga- Yes
Canfield- Yes
Frenkel- No
Kirshenbaum - No
Gadsden- Yes
Davis No

Recordings of this meeting will be forwarded to the absent commissioners if requested.

REGULATORY HEARING #372

Application #372
Blk. #301, Lot #15;

Applicants Lisa Zhang and David Quinn
181 Sagamore Rd.

This is a Non-designated site in the Wyoming Historic District. The applicant seeks to construct a new two story single family house.

Mr. Klesse presented previous plans that have been presented comparing where the new plans conform to changes suggested by the Commission. A scaled down house was presented.

Upon hearing no questions from the public, Mr. Gadsden opened questions to the Commission

Mrs. McNett and Mr. Frenkel, Mr. Kirshenbaum stated the house blends well into the neighborhood.

Mrs. Canfield questioned the choice of the retaining walls. Mr. Klesse stated the walls in the foreground are shorter giving better options of stone or lose slate stone. The high walls have to be less decorative as a concrete wall with a stone veneer. The height of the walls was questioned. Mr. Klesse presented the measurements of a tapered wall as well as the wall by the driveway which could be done in stone. A landscape plan was requested. Mr. Klesse stated one can be developed. Spec sheets were requested. Mr. Forbes will email a list to Mr. Ross.

Mrs. Wanga's concern is the height of the retaining walls. Mr. Klesse explained the height of the walls in detail.

Mrs. Canfield agrees that the walls on the right of the driveway should be stone which would be comparable to the homes in the area. Mrs. Canfield would like to see material samples of stones after Mr. Ross's approval. A subcommittee will be created to review samples of the actual stone to confirm that the stone will be comparable to other stone walls in the vicinity. Mr. Klesse agreed to present a sample of the stone to the Subcommittee. All walls will be constructed with stone. The Subcommittee will also review a plan depicting the proposed placement of landscaping designed to mitigate views toward the nearby designated site.

Mr. Forbes passed samples of trim of the dormers, porch ceilings, porch railings, window and door casings, porch trim, composite siding, and asphalt shingles and brick accents.

Windows were explained.

The stone will be by R-Stone, square veneer and the shade is "Carmel Hill". The stone facing on the residence and on the walls shall be the same. The short walls will be in boulder form. The

HISTORIC PRESERVAITON COMMISSION MINUTES

August 4, 2016

retaining wall will be stone facing on concrete. Mr. Forbes circulated a photo of the proposed stone.

Attorney Falcon stated he will prepare a resolution conditioned upon review by the Subcommittee of the conditional items.

Upon a motion by Elizabeth Wanga to approve, seconded by Alison Canfield and with a unanimous roll call vote, the application was approved.

Mrs. Canfield-Yes

Mrs. McNett-Yes

Mr. Frenkel-Yes

Mr. Gadsden-Yes

Mrs. Wanga-Yes

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Education/Outreach Committee will report at the September meeting.

2015 Annual Report-Mrs. McNett stated the annual report was well done. Mr. Ross stated that once the new ordinance is passed. The commission will be eligible to apply for funding.

Following the subcommittee review and acceptance, the Historic Preservation Ordinance Revisions should be placed on the Township Agenda by September.

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 11:07 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary