



THE TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN

375 MILLBURN AVENUE
MILLBURN, NEW JERSEY 07041

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
February 1, 2018

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, December 7, 2017 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Chairman Gadsden opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Chair Gadsden, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Frenkel, Mr. Davis,
Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. Sharma, Mrs. Esquivel, Mr. Owolabi, Mrs. Canfield

ABSENT:

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Andrew Brewer, Barton Ross Historic Preservation Consultant
and Secretary Nicole Verducci

Commissioner Oaths of Office

New Commissioners, Mr. Owolabi, Mrs. Esquivel and Mrs. Sharma were sworn in by Attorney Brewer.

Election of Officers for 2018

Attorney Brewer called for a motion placing a name in nomination for Chairman. Upon a motion made by Commissioner Gaylord naming William Gadsden, seconded by Commissioner Wanga, and with a unanimous roll call vote, Commissioner Gadsden was elected Chairman.

Commissioner Gadsden called for a motion placing a name in nomination for Vice Chairman. Upon a motion made by Commissioner Gadsden naming Karen Gaylord, seconded by

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

February 1, 2018

Commissioner Wanga, and with a unanimous roll call vote, Commissioner Gaylord was elected Vice Chairman.

Chair Gadsden called for a motion placing a name in nomination for Secretary. Upon a motion made by William Gadsden, Nicole Verducci was named, and with unanimous voice vote, Nicole Verducci was elected Secretary.

CLG Certification.

Mr. Ross stated we are recognized as the 46th municipality as a Certified Local Government in New Jersey. Qualifying us for annual funding through the Federal Government. This gives us priority assistance from the Historical Preservation Office.

MEETING MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gadsden to approve the minutes of the December 7, 2017 meeting as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

MEMORIALIZATIONS:

From December 7, 2017:

Denial of Application #401, Meilee Zheng, 76 Cedar St., Wyoming Historic District

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to deny Application #401 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

- Mr. Davis-Yes
- Mr. Frenkel-Yes
- Mr. Gadsden-Yes
- Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
- Mrs. Wanga-Yes
- Mrs. Canfield-Yes

said motion to deny was carried

NEW BUSINESS

Application #402
Block #3104, Lot #5

Applicant: **Jason & Sara Singer**
177 Highland Ave.

Application for major renovations, landscaping and home additions.

Sara Singer, Jason Singer, the home owners and Hildie Lazar, Architect, were sworn in.

Mrs. Lazar stated they would like to remove a one story addition used as a butler's pantry and replace it with a two story addition with a garage enclosure, a mudroom and a guest room. In addition a new attached one car garage on the right of the driveway attached with a breezeway

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**February 1, 2018**

will be added to maintain order to the house. Deteriorated brick was addressed and the driveway placement was discussed.

Mrs. Lazar presented the elements for discussion in detail marked as A-1. Deteriorated rear yard walls were presented. Views of the driveway were shown.

The history of the house was explained. A non functioning chimney was presented as well as window style. Exhibit D-1, a map of the property was circulated.

Currently the main living room is used as a family room. Referring to 1-E, the current dark wood windows with an overhang were presented in detail. It is proposed to replace the current doors with sleek doors and more glass and eliminate the overhang.

Mrs. Lazar stated that the rooms in the home are connected with small doorways darkening the home. The kitchen has no room for a table. They are proposing to extend the house to the left by 16 feet creating a large eat in kitchen. Referring to exhibit 1-F, the dining room currently has a small bump out which will be eliminated and extend the dining room with a glass wall.

The mudroom will be added with a breezeway connecting the house for functionality. Adding a room above the mudroom will create a guest suite.

The stone and brick will match exactly to the current house. A synthetic slate was presented to replace the existing slate roof.

The current two car unused garage is narrow and not usable. They presented moving the garage doors up for better usability.

Mrs. Lazar stated the driveway is treacherous due to its placement. A circular driveway with two exits was presented. Entrances will be on Stewart and a second on Highland as to not change the current court yard. The court yards surface is uneven and they would like to pave, making it safer and cleaner.

Mrs. Lazar presented in detail photos of the neighborhood houses as Exhibit 1-G, referring to an evolving neighborhood.

Mrs. Lazar referred to the Millburn Township Historical Preservation Code in detail.

Mrs. Wanga questioned the chimney removal. Mrs. Lazar stated there are three chimneys. The aesthetic chimney on the left end will be moved to the end of the addition to maintain the look of the house. Mrs. Wanga questioned if keeping the rear brick work was considered. Mrs. Lazar stated they did not consider keeping a roof over the family room doors because it is problematic. Gutters and leaders will be maintained. A second floor window pattern will be maintained but updated with a sleeker version referring to HPC-7. Mrs. Wanga questioned why the roof would be replaced. Mrs. Lazar presented a light weight synthetic sleight called DaVinci. Mrs. Lazar presented a photo of the current roof marked 1-H. Mrs. Wanga questioned the percentage of the roof that needs repair. Mr. Singer stated the addition would have to match the old roof and he feels over 50% is discolored, rusted or has issues. The current roof is 94 years old.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**February 1, 2018**

Mrs. Wanga questioned if there are other driveway options. Mr. Singer stated due to safety issues, the driveway is not functional and a massive liability due to its intersection of Highland and Stewart. Mrs. Wanga feels the windows add a lot of light but they don't keep with the rest of the house. Mrs. Wanga feels the driveway should be revisited to make it grander. Mrs. Lazar stated the driveway would then be skewed. She feels the only viable way is to have it branch off on each side.

Mrs. Esquivel asked of the driveway's current material. Mrs. Singer stated it is completely gravel and uneven and no curb. Mrs. Esquivel asked if they propose to pave the current driveway. Mr. Singer stated asphalt is their wish.

Mrs. Sharma questioned the length of the proposed driveway. Mrs. Lazar stated it is approximately 170 feet with an additional 20 foot curve. Mr. Davis questioned the number of paved driveways are in the area. Mrs. Singer stated that she can think of only one driveway that is not. Mr. Davis feels a paved driveway will change the look. He feels a gravel driveway will be more consistent.

Mrs. Canfield questioned the thinning of the windows. Mrs. Lazar presented a wood core window with an aluminum clad exterior. They chose a black or dark bronze. Sample literature was circulated. Mrs. Singer stated the windows will have less wood and more light coming in with the intention of keeping with the look of the house.

Mr. Owolabi asked for clarification of the area of the house that will be removed. Mrs. Lazar referring to HPC-3 stated that the addition that will be removed does not conform to the house. Mrs. Lazar stated the proposed two story addition will mimic the facade.

Mr. Davis questioned as to why a synthetic roof is necessary. Mr. Davis is concerned how the roof will weather over time. He feels slate is the better choice. Mr. Singer stated from any angle of the street, the roof will resemble slate. Uniformity and a warranty are important to them. Mr. Davis questioned if the chimney will be demolished. Mrs. Lazar confirmed that it will be demolished and replaced in a like stone. Mr. Davis cited NPS Technical Preservation Brief No. 29 "The Repair, Replacement and Maintenance of Historic Slate Roofs by Jeffrey Levine (1992) as the basis to reject the synthetic slate. The brief specifically states that the "use of artificial, mineral fiber slate is not recommended for restoration work since its rigid appearance is that of a manmade material and not one of nature.

Mr. Frenkel commented he likes the design as well as the windows. He feels the driveway should be pavers transitioning to the street with asphalt.

Mrs. Canfield feels the slate should be maintained and not replaced. Mrs. Canfield likes the left side of the house. She dislikes the windows and feels they are too contemporary for a classic colonial house. Mrs. Lazar stated the windows are not seen from the front of the house. Mrs. Canfield commented that in keeping with the historic nature of the house, some of the changes are giving mixed signals. She feels the driveway and pebble path is unique to the community. She feels the slate roof needs to be removed and the supports need to be put in the structure to hold the slate roof including the breezeways. To match the existing roof she feels it will not be worth keeping. Mrs. Canfield stated that the driveway has options such as electric under the stone, and the driveway is the uniqueness of the house. She requested clarity of the positioning of the house. Mrs. Canfield and Mr. Gadsden would like to see a 3d version of the proposal

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**February 1, 2018**

making it easier to make a decision. Mrs. Canfield likes the idea of adding flair of contemporary. Mrs. Canfield requested clarity on colors and materials. Mrs. Lazar stated only the butler's pantry will be removed and the changes of the windows will only be from the street.

It was agreed that the application will be amended and presented with a 3D model as well as simplified plans at the March meeting.

Application #403
Block #3103, Lot #34

Applicant: **Brian Charters**
55 Stewart Rd.

Application for an exterior shed.

Brian Charters, homeowner was sworn in.

Mr. Charters stated that his corner lot has an area where a shed will be placed that is not visible from the street.

Mr. Davis as well as Mrs. Esquivel, Mr. Frenkel, Mrs. Gaylord are in agreement. Mrs. Sharma asked if the shed backs up to a tree. Mr. Charters stated it is not.

With no further questions or comments a motion by Commissioner Davis to approve the application, seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

said motion to approve was carried

Application #404
Block #303, Lot #9

Applicant: **Sumit Haldar**
439 Wyoming Ave.

Application for major renovations, including landscaping and a rear house addition

Mr. Sumit Haldar, Homeowner and Gene Nemeth, Architect, were sworn in.

Mr. Nemeth presented the renovation in detail including window replacement, trim replacement and stated the roofline pitch will remain the same.

Mr. Haldar stated that due to a growing family, better usable space is needed in the structure.

Mr. Ross read his report giving the history of the house. Mr. Ross feels the need for space is understood and agrees with the design. Mr. Ross's concerns are the windows on the elevation. Mr. Haldar feels the elevations are accurately depicted by the photographs given. Mr. Ross feels the siding should be field painted and hardy planked. He feels the massing and scale is appropriate.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES February 1, 2018

Mr. Ross suggested a Minor Review Sub Committee is formed.

Mr. Davis questioned the Azac choice. Mr. Ross stated it is appropriate due to areas that get wet.

Mrs. Judith Christian, resident was sworn in. She questioned the distance between the edge of the exiting driveway and the end of the edition. Mr. Nemeth stated it will be 4-5 feet. She questioned if the raised porch will remain. Mr. Nemeth confirmed it will remain with an enclosed rear door.

With no comments from the commission, it was agreed to create a minor review committee after meeting with the zoning board.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #404 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Gaylord and subject to the approval by a Subcommittee appointed by the Chair and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Gadsden-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

**Application #397
Block #302, Lot #14**

Applicant: **Meilee Zheng
74 Cedar St.**

Conceptual Review to demolish an existing home and build a new 2-1/2 story house with attached 2-car garage and other site improvements.

Mrs. Zheng, referring to an Email, presented a tax map stating the square footage of the proposed house as well as neighboring houses. A floor plan was included in this email.

Mrs. Zheng is requesting a decision without any proposal.

Attorney Brewer explained that with three new members, a presentation must be made.

Mr. Davis stated feedback can't be given without a design presented.

Mr. Gadsden explained that this is a conceptual hearing and they would have to go through a Regulatory hearing in order to approve an application.

Mr. Klesse questioned if the same design can be re-presented by changing a roof line and removing the circular driveway. Mr. Brewer stated it is acceptable to hear that case.

Mr. Klesse presented the proposed building as a large mass as the primary element with a detached garage as a secondary element with a third element linking the building.

The building and garage will be pushed back.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

February 1, 2018

Mr. Klesse also referred the “link” as a breezeway with a flat roof.

An additional room will be added to the link giving a habitable third floor area.

A photo of a house was circulated as an example of how they would like to proceed with the application.

Mrs. Gaylord asked if the bump out on the back of the garage is part of the roofline. Mr. Klesse confirmed it is. Mrs. Gaylord questioned the garage placement. Mr. Klesse showed its placement.

Mrs. Canfield asked the difference in square footage. Mr. Klesse stated they are about the same size, just broken into two masses.

Mr. Davis questioned the roof. Mr. Klesse stated the material will be slate line asphalt.

They agreed to return to the March 2nd meeting for a Regulatory hearing.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 9:45pm

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary

Nicole Verducci, Secretary/Clerk

The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is March 1, 2018