



THE TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN

375 MILLBURN AVENUE
MILLBURN, NEW JERSEY 07041

**MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
July 12, 2018**

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, July 12, 2018 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Acting Chairperson Canfield opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Mr. Gadsden, Mr. Davis, Mr. Frenkel,
Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. Esquivel, Mr. Owolabi, Mrs. Sharma

ABSENT: Mrs. Gaylord, Mrs. Canfield,

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Andrew Brewer, Barton Ross Historic Preservation Consultant
and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MEETING MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Commissioner Frenkel to approve the minutes of the June 7, 2018 meeting as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 12, 2018****MEMORIALIZATIONS:**

1. Approval of Application #416, Jessica Chanin, 89 Cedar St., Wyoming Historic District

Upon a motion by Commissioner Frenkel to approve Application #416 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Davis-Yes
 Mr. Frenkel-Yes
 Mrs. Wanga-Yes
 Mrs. Gadsden-Yes
 Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
 Mr. Owolabi-Yes
 Mrs. Sharma-Yes

said motion was carried

OLD BUSINESS

**Application #412
 Block #2202, Lot #6**

Applicant: **Matthew and Melanie Rosenbaum
 18 Moraine Pl**

Application to replace roofing, siding, and trim materials, install replacement windows and garage doors, and site improvements including a new driveway connection with pavement.

Matthew and Melanie Rosenbaum, homeowners presented roofing materials and samples to the Commission. The previous presentation of the circular driveway was discussed. A survey was presented marked Exhibit A1 and A2. Exhibit A3 was circulated; presenting a metal roof sample in a bronze tone. The windows will be in the same bronze tone as the roof color. Mr. Rosenbaum stated that the metal roof is a recycled product and is the most appropriate, providing a light weight configuration for the existing framing. Exhibit A4 and A5 was circulated along with samples representing an asphalt roof. Photos of neighboring houses referring to the metal roofs were circulated.

Mr. Ross stated a metal roof is appropriate. Mr. Ross referred to the neighboring metal roofs as well. He feels that this era of the home fits well with a metal roof.

Mrs. Wanga asked if they would consider a more natural siding color. Mr. Rosenbaum stated this is the color he prefers due to the scale of the home. With such a small mass, he is looking for contrast.

Mr. Owolabi stated he does not like the metal roof.

Mr. Frenkel questioned the fencing. Mr. Rosenbaum stated it will be maintained. Mrs. Rosenbaum stated they are requesting a circular driveway due to the damage done by a previous storm. Mr. Frankel and Mrs. Esquivel commented that they liked the proposal.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 12, 2018**

Mr. Davis stated he likes the plan but would like to see a deeper exterior color. He feels it is a complete package.

Mr. Gadsden opened any questions to the public. With no further questions and upon a motion by Commissioner Frenkel to approve Application #412 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with a roll call vote as follows.

Mr. Davis-Yes
 Mr. Frenkel-Yes
 Mrs. Wanga-Yes
 Mrs. Gadsden-Yes
 Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
 Mr. Owolabi-Yes
 Mrs. Sharma-Yes

NEW BUSINESS

Application #417
Block #3104, Lot #2

Applicant: **Jake Feldman**
153 Highland Ave

Applicant seeks to demolish portions of an existing home and build a new 2-1/2 story house with an attached 3-car garage and other site improvements.

Peter Wolfson, Attorney of Day Pitney, Jake Feldman and Robin Feldman Homeowners, Timothy Klesse and Robert Forbes, Architects were sworn in.

Mr. Wolfson, referring to the previous review, presented changes to the proposal that the Feldman's are seeking.

Jake Feldman spoke of his family connections to the town. Mr. Feldman's father is serving as the builder of the approved changes.

Mr. Klesse provided his educational background in architecture. A site plan was presented, marked HPC1. An accessory structure to the home was presented with other site developments. Mr. Klesse proposed a new house in the foreground of the property. A new building, pool, pool deck, patio was discussed briefly. The center portion of the structure will remain. A small gardener shed was removed that was constructed before the accessory building. The accessory structure will remain as a cabana. A tennis court is added to the rear. The driveway will stay in the same location as it currently is.

Mr. Gadsden asked how much farther back is the house us pushed compared to the previous presentation. Mr. Klesse stated it was pushed back 50 feet. Mr. Klesse and Mr. Forbes presented a 3D presentation.

A center hall colonial design was presented. Mr. Klesse said the plan is symmetrical, organized and conforms to the ordinances. The area totals 8755 square feet including the garage.

The second floor was presented. A 6 foot ceiling height was discussed.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 12, 2018**

Mr. Klesse, referring to the 3D presentation stated that the structure is beautifully detailed and exquisite.

All sides of the house were presented.

Mr. Klesse presented the carriage house which was circulated and marked Exhibit A1. Mr Klesse stated that the center section of the existing structure is made of brick and stone, the upper and lower portion will be removed, and he will restore the covered porch in order to utilize the existing fireplace. The center door will be removed and windows will be replaced and installed to their original spots. A patio was removed and while using the existing doorway, a covered area was proposed in order to access the pool. The present roof steps down two feet and will be raised. A small kitchen and game room was shown. A closet was removed from the second floor. A storage area remains.

The pool facing side (right side) of the home was presented. A brick chimney and stone around the windows will remain.

The rear side of the house was presented by Mr. Klesse in detail.

Photos of the accessory building were presented as a streetscape to give a sense of the surrounding area and views as well as scale.

Mr. Klesse presented material samples referring to a list of materials that was in the Commissioner's packets. An Antique Slate line roof material was presented. An exterior white washed brick with a light mortar was presented marked as Exhibit A2. Stone will be utilized on the front stoop to get a design recall from the previous design. Crown trim was presented. Cedar shakes and exterior casing was presented.

Mr. Klesse stated the pool needs a four foot high fence which can be a metal mesh or a metal fence. Mr. Ross suggested a cut sheet is presented at the next hearing. A chain link tennis court was suggested by Mr. Klesse. Mr. Ross agreed but suggests it is painted black for discretion. Mr. Ross requested real stone rather than cultured stone on the retaining walls and their placement. Mr. Ross suggested the stone be salvaged from the old green house. Mr. Ross asked that driveway materials are presented at the next meeting.

Mr. Frenkel questioned Mr. Ross on his wall recommendation. Mr. Ross stated the walls will be removed but can be kept as a decorative wall. Mr. Frenkel finds the old house interesting and keeps in the spirit of the property. He likes keeping the stone and incorporating the brick.

Mr. Frenkel and Esquivel agreed that two of the most important streets in town surround the house. They feel it fits nicely in the neighborhood. Mr. Frenkel stated the size of the house fits in the property. He stated it will contribute to the neighborhood.

Referring to the proposed house, Mrs. Wang questioned the roofing materials of the neighboring houses. Mr. Klesse stated some are slate, rubber, tile, wood and asphalt. Mrs. Wang and Mrs. Sharma and Mrs. Esquivel agreed 80% have slate and feels asphalt will still be seen from the street. In general Mrs. Wang has issues with the massing and scale. The garage is too large and is not appropriate with the house. She feels they should refer to Mr. Ross's recommendations. She feels this needs to be studied more to get a successful combination of massing and scale.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 12, 2018**

Mrs. Sharma questioned where the pool is going to be located. Mr. Klesse stated that it is located behind walkway, beyond the patio which is directly behind the building. Mrs. Sharma questioned a storm water issue. Mr. Klesse stated it is away from the property. Mrs. Sharma asked if there are neighbors behind the house. Mr. Klesse confirmed. Mrs. Sharma questioned the grading towards the rear neighbors property. Mr. Klesse stated the neighbor's property is elevated. Mrs. Sharma asked for landscape plans. Mr. Klesse agreed to devise a plan at the next meeting. Trees removal was discussed.

Mrs. Sharma questioned the use of the original house. Mr. Klesse stated it is a recreation room or accessory building. Mrs. Sharma asked how the house was originally used. Mr. Klesse stated it was a carriage house and later after two additions, made into a house.

Mr. Owolabi questioned the distance from the property line to the tennis courts. Mr. Klesse stated 24 feet to the fence complying with the ordinance. Mr. Owolabi suggested that the pool, tennis court and patio are added to the 3D presentation for better visualization. Mrs. Esquivel feels the 3D changes are not necessary.

Mr. Davis stated the house is linear and broad. He asked that they compare the type of structures that surround the proposed home. He feels the exterior brick facade does not fit. A landscape plan is necessary. Mr. Davis would like to see a landscape plan around the circular driveway. Mr. Davis questioned if other homes are using Slate Line roofing. How does that weather over time? Mr. Davis likes that the house is being saved and the additions are not doing any justice. The plans that were received tonight need to be digested by the Commission. He would like to see more on material types and how the existing historical walls will be retained. He feels they are moving in the right direction.

Mrs. Wanga is comfortable with bringing the original house back.

Mr. Owolabi questioned the green house. Mr. Klesse stated it was built around 1962. This will be removed. Mr. Ross would like two walls to remain. Mr. Ross stated it was a tool shed.

Comments and Questions were opened up to the audience. John Gordon, Resident was sworn in. Mr. Gordon lives next door to 153 Highland. He supports the thought and work that is being presented. He would like to see it go forward.

With no further questions or comments it was agreed to return to the August 3rd meeting.

**Application #418
Block #2209, Lot #6**

Applicant: **Kerra and Addison Sollog
11 Barberry Ln**

Application to install a pergola addition, an outbuilding, fencing, landscaping and patio work.

Mr. Klesse presented on behalf of Kerra and Addison Sollog.

Referring to Exhibit A-1 Mr. Klesse stated that Board of Adjustment Approval is needed due to the rear yard unoccupied. Mr. Klesse stated a fence (type B) will be installed around an air conditioning unit behind the garage. An outdoor shower and toilet also will be installed behind the garage. 139 square feet of new patio with an additional 12 square feet in the corner. 24 Square feet of walkway to the shower was added. A door to the garage with a 19 square foot stoop and a trellis over an existing patio for shade. 128 square feet of patio will be added beyond the patio. 80 square feet of

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

July 12, 2018

patio will be removed and a fence (Type A) added around the garden. A landscape plan was presented.

Exhibit A3 showed the fence types and the placement. An existing fence going along the house will remain. Elevations were presented. Mr. Klesse stated everything is concealed from the street.

Mrs. Esquivel questioned the walls in the bathroom. Mr. Klesse stated there is a flat roof with openings for air to get through. Mrs. Esquivel asked if the pergola is new. Mr. Klesse confirmed.

Mr. Davis questioned if you would see the Type A fence from the front. Mr. Klesse stated the fence is a garden fence.

Mrs. Wanga, Sharma and Owolabi approved the designs.

Mr. Frenkel questioned the siding. Mr. Klesse stated a wood horizontal siding. 5'X10'.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #418 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Davis and subject to the approval by a Subcommittee appointed by the Chair and with a roll call vote as follows

Mr. Davis-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mrs. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mr. Owolabi-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 9:22 pm

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary

Nicole Verducci, Secretary/Clerk

The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is August 2, 2018