



THE TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN

375 MILLBURN AVENUE
MILLBURN, NEW JERSEY 07041

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
August 2, 2018

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, August 2, 2018 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Acting Chairperson Canfield opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Mr. Gadsden, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Frenkel,
Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. Esquivel, Mr. Owolabi, Mrs. Sharma

ABSENT: Mrs. Canfield, Mr. Davis Mr. Davis

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Andrew Brewer, Barton Ross Historic Preservation Consultant
and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MEETING MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Commissioner Frenkel to approve the minutes of the July 12, 2018 meeting as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

MEMORIALIZATIONS:

1. Approval of Application #412, Matthew and Melanie RosenbaumMatthew and Melanie Rosenbaum, 18 Moraine Pl., Short Hills Park Historic District

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

August 2, 2018

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #412 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frankel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mrs. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes

said motion was carried

2. Approval of Application #418, Kerra and Addison Sollog, 11 Barberry Ln., Short Hills Park Historic District

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #418 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frankel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mrs. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes
Mr. Owolabi-Yes

said motion was carried

OLD BUSINESS

**Application #417
Block #3104, Lot #2**

Applicant: **Jake Feldman
153 Highland Ave**

Applicant seeks to demolish portions of an existing home and build a new 2-1/2 story house with an attached 3-car garage and other site improvements.

Previously sworn, Peter Wolfson, Attorney of Day Pitney, Jake Feldman, Homeowner, Timothy Klesse and Robert Forbes, Architects came forward.

Mr. Pitney and Mr. Feldman welcomed the Commission telling his intent to show the Commission their new plans for construction.

Mr. Klesse, presented a site plan and it was pointed out that no retaining walls were included. Exhibit A8-2-1 was circulated showing a pool fence connecting to existing fences, a chain link fence surrounding a tennis court and a landscaping plan. Exhibit 3D-A4, a video of the street from Stewart to Minisink to Highland Avenue with views of the house was presented. 9 foot steaks in the ground were referred to in detail as well as various tree sizes and shrubs blocking the house from the street.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**August 2, 2018**

Foundation and driveway planting for shielding was presented. Decorative trees were briefly discussed. Marked Exhibit A8-2-3.

Exhibit 3D-A5 was a presentation of the house. Mr. Klesse presented a scaling down of the side of the house in response to the Commission's request. The house was pushed back, dropped down and a roof was added to make the house smaller. The second floor was pulled back 3 feet. A 70 foot Norway spruce will remain to shield the view of the structure.

Rear elevations were presented in detail. Mr. Klesse, referring to the streetscape, addressed the roof type. Mr. Klesse stated due to the price of the Commission's suggested slate roof, they have requested an asphalt roof which is also comparable to the houses in the district, marked Exhibit 8-2-A6. Mr. Klesse presented a photo example of a Slate Line roof. Samples of the Slate Line roof materials were presented. A photo of a house on Forrest Drive was shown with the same roof.

Mrs. Wanga stated Mr. Ross's comments were very successful and she does not feel Mr. Klesse's plans go along with Mr. Ross's comments. She feels the garage should be less oversized.

Mrs. Sharma asked if the slate line wares as well as slate. Mr. Klesse stated the roofs don't typically fail due to the materials. They fail at the connections. Mr. Sharma asked what percentage of neighboring houses is slate. Mr. Klesse stated a majority are slate referring to photos. Mr. Feldman pointed out that the existing Carriage House is asphalt. Mr. Klesse pointed out that you will not see a difference from the street and it is a good alternative to an unreasonable expense. Mrs. Sharma feels some items were not addressed in Mr. Ross's report. Mr. Klesse referred to the items. Mr. Klesse feels the dormers should be included. Exhibit 8-2-A7 was circulated showing dormers that they plan to build. Mr. Klesse stated they want a second floor over the building. A large tree in addition to plantings will be discussed. Mr. Klesse feels it was addressed previously. Mr. Klesse stated that six over nine windows will allow the house to match the size of the windows above. The smaller garage windows do not apply. Mr. Ross requested a print record of the 3D presentation.

A Civil Engineer looked at the site and stated there will be no new retaining walls. Mr. Klesse stated that regarding the design of the house, it is a Colonial Revival Home that he would like to fall into the district. Mr. Klesse argued that the house is not bland and is a gorgeous house. Mr. Ross commented that breaking up the mass and moving the garage back, making it an L shape will be an improvement. Mr. Wolfson stated that the views are more about the architectural aspects. Exterior materials are going to be utilized which is the basis of them being here. The Rosenbaum are agreeing to restore the house to its original state at the Commission's request. The historic building is characterized as a Colonial Revival Style as Mr. Klesse Presented. Mr. Wolfson feels the comments and the reviews are more about the architectural aspects than the historical significance. Mr. Wolfson continued with the issues he felt should be addressed.

Mr. Klesse referring to Exhibit 8-2-A9 circulated a white wash brick.

Mrs. Sharma would like to see solution to all of Mr. Ross's comments.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**August 2, 2018**

Mrs. Esquivel questioned the evergreen screen. Mr. Klesse stated it is new. Mrs. Esquivel questioned if the carriage house roof was assumed to be wood. Mrs. Esquivel asked the difference in price of Slate to Asphalt price.

Mr. Joseph Feldman, a contractor was sworn in. Mr. Feldman gave his background. Mr. Feldman stated, Asphalt will be \$80,000 compared to \$350,000-\$400,000.

Mrs. Esquivel asked why the Carriage House is being restored. Mr. Wolfson said it will be restored at the Commission's request.

Mrs. Gaylord stated she is not convinced that the white washing will improve this house. She feels the other homes on the street have dimension and texture. She feels Mr. Ross's design is more interesting. Mrs. Gaylord feels it is not a Georgian Colonial and finds it inappropriate. Mrs. Gaylord questioned a large cedar by the left corner of the property. Mr. Klesse stated the tree is the town's property. After review of the meeting minutes, Mr. Doty, on August 31st, stated in an email the following: "PLEASE note at 153 Highland (8/2 Minutes) the Township does not plant evergreen trees in the road right of way, and therefore they are the property owner's responsibility. Plus it is not Township property it is a Right of Way. (They might depending upon diameter need a Township tree removal permit.)"

Mr. Frankel feels the house is in keeping with the neighborhood. He likes the materials. Mr. Owolabi questioned if they are willing to make the changes requested. Mr. Wolfson stated the Feldman's feel they have addressed their historic obligation of the historic structure.

After a brief break Mr. Klesse added an additional change referring to HPC-16 stating they will add wood clap board siding with extensive planting as a direct response to one of Mr. Ross's suggestions.

Mrs. Esquivel questioned if Mr. Ross feels progress has been made. Mr. Ross said a lot of progress has been made but the left side of the house needs to be addressed.

Mr. Ross referred to his report in detail showing similarities and differences of Mr. Klesse's presentation. Mr. Ross agrees with Mr. Klesse that the house originally had wood with a slate overtop. He feels Mr. Klesse's asphalt roof type is a good product. Mr. Ross feels a condition should be included that real stone is used in the even a retaining wall is needed. The design guidelines refer to not having everything on the same plane. Having more variation. Mr. Ross read to the Millburn Design Guidelines. Mr. Ross feels pulling back the garage will make it look less like a large linear shape.

Mr. Frenkel, referring to the garage, asked for clarification on the orientation that Mr. Ross is looking for. Mr. Ross stated that Mr. Klesse has the right approach but he feels it should be pushed back farther.

A vote was requested by Mr. Wolfson. Mr. Wolfson stated that it is not a matter of the client complying, the client has address the comments with the focus of their consideration on the historic issues. The ordinance is not the easiest to understand from his perspective and stated what he feels should be excluded from a non-contributing home.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**August 2, 2018**

Mr. Brewer stated the standards and criteria in detail at Mrs. Wanga's request.

Mr. Klesse, referring to the main building, stated it was the intent to show movement and dimension on the first and second floor.

With no further questions and upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to deny Application #417 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Sharma and with a roll call vote as follows.

Mr. Frenkel- No
 Mrs. Wanga- Yes
 Mrs. Gadsden- Yes
 Mrs. Esquivel- No
 Mr. Owolabi- Yes
 Mrs. Sharma- Yes

NEW BUSINESS

Application #415415
Block #2201, Lot #8

Applicant: **Harry Gross**
121 Highland Ave.

Applicant seeks to remove existing damaged fence and replace with wrought iron fencing.

Mr. Bob Hessels, RDH Design was sworn in. Mr. Hessels spoke on Mr. Gross's behalf.

Mr. Hessels, referring to the circulated plans, stated the current stockade fence which is in disrepair, will be moved and replaced with an iron fence with stone pillars.

A classical stone was chosen. A variance is required due to height and a corner lot. The current fence will be the same 6 foot height as the original. The pillars will be higher in order to hold the fencing. The iron fence style will be picket with a black finish. Decorative circles will be on the top and bottom for style. A small knuckle detail will be on the pickets themselves. The columns will be a pattern of random stone that is indigenous to the area. The material will be a mix of limestone, brownstone and granite of various shapes with natural stone with blue stone caps.

Mr. Frenkel asked if a plainer style was discussed. Mr. Hessels feels that the decorative fencing was more of the Harshorn style.

Mr. Owolabi asked for an explanation of the current fence. Mr. Hessel stated it is a wooden stockade.

Mrs. Sharma asked if the fence is visible from the road. Mr. Hessel stated the property is heavily vegetated behind the fence. The exposed fence will hide into the landscape but is visible from the road. Mrs. Sharma asked if the fence height was considered. Mr. Hessel stated his client would like to keep the height for safety reasons as well as aesthetics.

Mr. Hessel agreed to provide samples to a subcommittee conforming to the drawings.

Mrs. Esquivel feels it is a nice improvement as well as Mr. Frenkel, Mrs. Gaylord and Mrs. Wanga.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

August 2, 2018

Mr. Gadsden asked if the different stones decay at different rates. Mr. Hessel stated they do, but the color variation gives a more natural look and has been done for years.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #418 415 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Gaylord and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mrs. Gadsden-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mr. Owolabi-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 9:20 pm

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary

The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is September 6, 2018.