



THE TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN

375 MILLBURN AVENUE
MILLBURN, NEW JERSEY 07041

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
January 10, 2019

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, January 10, 2019 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Chair Canfield opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Chair Canfield, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Frenkel, Mr. Davis, Mr. Kramer
Mrs. Wanga, Mrs. Sharma, Mr. Owolabi

ABSENT: Mrs. Esquivel

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Andrew Brewer, Barton Ross Historic Preservation Consultant
and Secretary Nicole Verducci

Commissioner Oaths of Office

New Commissioner, Mr. Kramer as well as reappointed Commissioner's Wanga, Sharma, and Owolabi was sworn in by Attorney Brewer.

Election of Officers for 2019

Commissioner Gaylord called for a motion placing a name in nomination for Chair. Upon a motion made by Commissioner Gaylord naming Alison Canfield seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with a unanimous roll call vote, Commissioner Canfield was elected Chair.

Commissioner Canfield called for a motion placing a name in nomination for Vice Chair. Upon a motion made by Commissioner Canfield naming Karen Gaylord and with a unanimous roll call vote, Commissioner Gaylord was elected Vice Chair.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

January 10, 2019

Chair Canfield called for a motion placing a name in nomination for Secretary. Upon a motion made by Commissioner Wanga, seconded by Commissioner Gaylord, Nicole Verducci was named, and with unanimous voice vote, Nicole Verducci was elected Secretary.

SCHEDULE OF MEETING DATES FOR 2019

1. Resolution Adopting the 2019 Meeting Schedule

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to adopt the 2019 Meeting Dates as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Gaylord and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mr. Kramer-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Owolabi-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes

said motion was carried

MEETING MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to approve the minutes of the December 6, 2018 meeting as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Owolabi and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

MEMORIALIZATIONS:

Approval of Application #424, Michael and Robin Sanchez, 37 Forest Dr., Short Hills

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to approve Application #424 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Sharma and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Owolabi-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes

said motion was carried

NEW BUSINESS

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

January 10, 2019

Application #426: 79 Cedar St.; Block #205, Lot #9; Non-Contributing Property; Wyoming Historic District / Eric Geller & Perrinne Robinson-Geller, Applicants

Applicant seeks to demolish and build a new detached garage.

Mr. Eric Geller, Resident along with Mr. James Weil, Architect were sworn in.

Mr. Geller stated that the current garage is not functional and is currently used for storage.

Mr. Weil presented his credentials.

Mr. Weil, referring to photos in the packet along with additional photos marked A-1 stated that the garage sits at the rear of the property and is in very poor condition. The roof had been previously replaced. The new garage will accommodate two cars with storage in the rear. The garage will be notched around a tree in order to preserve it.

Four elevations were presented. The siding will remain the same as the original structure. Colonial style overhead doors and lighting will be installed to match the existing house. GAF Timberline shingles of Fox Hollow Gray will be used.

A neighboring, similar renovation was shown by Mr. Weil.

Decorative brackets over the existing windows will be salvaged and reused.

Mr. Ross questioned the window manufacturer. Mr. Weil stated most likely Pella will be used.

Questions were opened to the Commission. Mr. Davis asked what materials will be used. Mr. Weil confirmed the decorative brackets will remain and are in good condition.

Mrs. Gaylord asked for a photo of the new garage doors. Mr. Weil referred to the packet.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #426 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mr. Kramer-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Owolabi-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes

said motion was carried

Application #427: 397 Wyoming Ave.; Block #204, Lot #11; Contributing Property; Wyoming Historic District / Matthew Levine and Natalie Hiott-Levine, Applicants

Applicant seeks to build a new rear/side addition and other site improvements.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**January 10, 2019**

Mr. and Mrs. Levine, Residents as well as Mr. John James, the Architect were sworn in.

Mrs. Levine spoke about the history of the home. They are requiring a first story bedroom for their handicapped child with an elevator. She is requesting an open space to allow her child to function comfortably in the house while keeping the character throughout. She referred to a book titled 100 Houses that the home is featured in.

Mr. James presented his credentials.

Mr. James, referring to Exhibit A-1, pictures of the original home was presented. The home was built in 1897 shingle style house. The wood was originally wood shingles and is now asphalt.

The window at the back top of the stairs will remain with the additions kept away from that area. Mr. James stated the shingle siding will match the addition as well as the windows. The front facade will remain unchanged. The flat roof on the right porch side will be renovated to a hip roof to replicate the original house.

A site plan was presented showing the original porch in a rectangular shape. A one story addition on the side of the house will allow a first floor bedroom with a side entry and a family room with a kitchen, mudroom, bathroom and laundry room behind the house with a flat roof to allow views of the back yard from the palladium window. A master bedroom suite will be added to an existing bedroom on the second floor above the kitchen. The front of the house will remain intact.

Floor plans were presented with a basement under the addition. An elevator will be incorporated in the footprint going from the basement to the first floor level allowing their son access to a recreation area. The Livingroom, foyer and dining room will be remain the existing conditions. A bay window will be installed in the kitchen to mirror the dining room. A set of windows will be removed from the dining room allowing an entry way to the kitchen. These windows will be relocated to the bedroom on the second floor.

A side entry will allow steps, maintaining a ramp along the natural grade. A grade level terrace will be on the back of the house.

The rear bedroom will become a master suite with a closet and bathroom.

Detailed railings will be installed on the back porch.

Front elevations were presented showing the addition and roof. Windows were presented. The driveway side was presented.

Side elevations showed a private porch accessible from the inside of the house. The front entry will be maintained. The side door will match the existing front door.

A new garage with materials matching the house will replace the existing garage that is not fit for use. Mr. James is proposing to relocate the garage. Its current location is in the center rear of the house collecting drainage from the houses above. The driveway's placement makes it difficult to turn around causing the terrace to be driven on. Footings will be dug effecting two large trees. An ash tree exists in the center of the yard with two trees near the garage. Moving the garage will give a turnaround space and move the driveway away from the house allowing for the addition.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**January 10, 2019**

Mr. Ross, referring to his report, recommends the porch be built exactly as the original historic photos of the house. Mr. Ross questioned where the ramp would be faced. Mr. Ross feels the starburst design should be used on the railings. Mr. Ross questioned the removal of the windows on the side elevations, making this area appear as an addition on the second floor. Mr. James explained the ramp placement along the side of the house. The ramp railing will be wood but may require a single metal bar. This has not been determined. Mr. Ross stated the location of the ramp will make it not visible from the street.

Mrs. Sharma asked for window clarification of the dining room window. Mr. James clarified it is the exact window being installed in the master bedroom that will be replaced with an entrance. Mrs. Sharma asked if changing the porch will be considered. Mr. James stated this is planned to be a family porch and is trying not to tear off portions of the house.

Regarding the railings, Mr. James is willing to go with the Sunburst style. The window size was chosen due to the configuration of the house. The windows will be centered in the rooms which is the reason for the sizes chosen.

Mr. Frenkel commented he is pleased with the plans.

Mr. Owolabi questioned the materials chosen. Mr. James stated the materials will match the existing house.

Mrs. Wanga asked if there is space between the addition and the porch. Mr. James confirmed. Mrs. Wanga suggested the porch is moved back further. Mr. James feels it doesn't make sense. He felt two walls to the porch will allow for privacy. The rectangle porch will be renovated to an "L" shape. Mrs. Wanga stated the porch is crowding the historic part of the home.

Mr. Davis questioned, regarding the rear of the home asked for the type of drainage on the flat roof. Mr. James stated it will have a slight slope. Mr. James stated the drainage will be around the perimeter of the house. Mr. Davis feels the oval window on the pitch can be changed to something more interesting. Mr. Davis questioned the number of trees being removed. Mr. James stated two trees within the footprint of the existing garage and three leading up to the garage along the driveway. Mr. James confirmed the proper setbacks will be remained and no variance is necessary. The garage will be facing the side. The intention is to match the height of the existing garage as to not disturb the grade level.

Mrs. Gaylord commented that the oval window added to the garage will tie it with the house. Mr. James stated they added a circular window due to the height. Mrs. Gaylord agreed and feels it is a well done design.

Mrs. Canfield asked Mr. Ross since most garages in the area are front facing, are there regulations of where the doors should face. Mr. Ross stated a variance will be needed. Mrs. Canfield commented on the importance of the house. She stated this house represents the neighborhood. She feels the HPC's requests are reasonable. Mrs. Canfield stated the house is tastefully done and well considered. Mr. James stated the windows will be changed to the HPC's request. The porch will be discussed because reconfiguration would be needed. Mrs. Levine stated that privatizing the porch will drive people to the front door.

Mrs. Parnass of 78 Pine Street was sworn in.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**January 10, 2019**

Mrs. Parnass protested the construction plan. Referring to the book titled American Renaissance she stated the houses should not be enlarged and referring to the book titled 100 Houses essay that an addition would be disastrous. Mrs. Parnass stated soil erosion and drainage will be an issue. Referring to Exhibit P1 and P2, recently taken by Mrs. Parnass of five trees with a map indicating the placement of the trees. She stated the majestic large trees provide privacy and a sound buffer. She finds the proposal unethical by ignoring the historic landscape. Mrs. Parnass stated the length of her property would be a wall of garages and an onsite parking lot. The design and scope is not appropriate for the historic character of the neighborhood. Referring to a Millburn Township Tree Removal Permit Application suggested the tree removal will alter the neighborhood. She asked the commission to reject the proposal.

Mr. John Zeitler of 78 Pine Street was sworn in.

Mr. Zeitler stated he is protesting the plan. Mr. Zeitler stated the trees are well over 100 years old and predate the house. He stated the house will no longer look historic without its majestic trees. Mr. Zeitler stated the garage should be where it originally exists. Mr. Zeitler questioned the protocol of tree removal. Mr. Ross clarified that permission is needed from the Town Forester (Mr. Doty). After reviewing our Resolutions and a landscape plan, before the applicants get their final permits, goes out to the site and tags the trees for removal when he does his inspection. Mr. Zeitler stated that Mr. Doty is the only person standing up to the HPC. Mrs. Canfield stated she appreciates his concern and will take into account his concerns. The purpose of the HPC is to preserve the actual property and the house itself. If Mr. Doty feels the trees are native, he will come back to the board and make his suggestions.

Mrs. Soloman, a next door resident to the proposed house was sworn in. She stated she happy with the renovation and believes it will be of service to the family. This environment is good for their children as well as the neighborhood. Mrs. Soloman is thrilled that they are staying and making the house work for their family.

Mrs. Canfield stated after hearing from the public, asked the applicants if they are willing to reconsider their plan.

Mr. Levine stated they have a need and the neighbors have a view. They are trying to do what is best for the property and family. Mr. Levin stated the Zeitlers want to preserve their view and thread a driveway through the trees and through the existing kitchen. Mr. Levine feels they are only concerned about their interests. The applicants are willing to make a number of changes. The expense is also a consideration and have tried many options. They feel this is the only way that works.

Mrs. Levine stated she is a conservationist and took trees into account. Leaving the garage risks damaging four trees. They have the intent to replant the trees that are removed and will comply with regulations. They intend to preserve the largest, oldest trees on the property.

The applicants requested a 5 minute recess.

After a five minute break, the Levine's decide a vote was necessary. Mr. James asked for a conditional approval on the presented application with no requested landscaping plan.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

January 10, 2019

Upon a motion by Commissioner Frenkel for a conditional approval on Application #427 with no Commissioner seconding, as submitted and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Canfield-No
Mr. Davis-No
Mrs. Wanga-No
Mrs. Gaylord-No
Mr. Owolabi-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-No

said motion was denied.

Application #428: 10 Wyndham Rd.; Block #2111, Lot #13; Contributing Property; Short Hills Park Historic District / Victor & Gretta Lander, Applicants

Applicant seeks to expand a rear addition and porch improvements.

Mr. and Mrs. Lander, Residents was sworn in.

Mr. Lander stated the rear of the house has a sloped roof and contains one bedroom and a bathroom. Mr. Lander is requesting the roof is raised and it is not visible from the street. Referring to a rear covered porch, the applicant is requesting an extension to be even with the existing window sill.

Mr. Ross stated, referring to a 1928 atlas and photos, the porch does not face the street and it makes useable sense. Mr. Ross questioned the windows and materials should be a painted wood.

Mr. Lander stated it will be Anderson windows and agrees to paint the wood.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Frenkel to approve Application #428 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Owolobi and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mr. Owolabi-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes

said motion was carried

ADJOURNMENT

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 9:45 pm

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

January 10, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary

The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is February 7, 2018.