



THE TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN

375 MILLBURN AVENUE
MILLBURN, NEW JERSEY 07041

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN
COUNTY OF ESSEX
April 4, 2019

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, April 4, 2019 at 7:30P.M. in Town Hall.

Chair Canfield opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Mrs. Canfield, Mrs. Gaylord, Mr. Frenkel, Mr. Davis, Mrs. Esquivel,
Mrs. Sharma, Mr. Owolabi, Mrs. Wanga

ABSENT: Mr. Kramer

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Andrew Brewer, Barton Ross Historic Preservation Consultant
and Secretary Nicole Verducci

MEETING MINUTES:

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to approve the minutes of the March 7, 2019 meeting as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

MEMORIALIZATIONS:

Approval of Application #429, Carly Drum and Mike O'Neill, 12 East Lane, Short Hills

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to approve Application #429 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with a roll call vote as follows:

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

April 4, 2019

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

said motion was carried

NEW BUSINESS

Application #431; 45 Forest Dr; Block #2204, Lot #8; Non-Contributing Property; Short Hills Park Historic District / Richard and Genevieve Walters – Applicant

Application for major building alterations with site improvements, built 1941.

Mr. Klesse, Architect and Richard and Genevieve Walters was sworn in.

Mr. Klesse stated the plan presented conforms to the Zoning rules. Referring to HPC1, a landscaping plan was presented. The garage will remain the same. The existing front porch will be enclosed. A two story area will be added to the back of the house. Referring to HPC2, a wider garage door will be installed. A mudroom will be created in the interior. Referring to HPC3, renovations were presented with an office and new stoop. An extension to the kitchen will allow for an eating area.

The second floor bedrooms will remain with a one story building on the left and the right with a larger master bathroom and walk in closet. The extension of a family room below the proposed bedrooms was presented.

Referring to HPC5, Mr. Klesse presented the front elevation with an existing slate roof. Windows will be replaced with the existing brick.

Rear elevations were presented. All new materials will match the existing home.

Forrester Doty's report regarding a 36 diameter tree was presented by Mr. Klesse. Mr. Klesse agreed to hire a service of an outside company to ensure no damage will be done to the tree. Mr. Ross stated retaining and landscape walls should be presented in detail. Paving materials need to be presented. The Garage Door should be replaced as a designer Carriage Series. A single door that appears to be a double door should be installed.

Mr. Klesse is proposing a mahogany door with a Carriage Door Style with four panels.

Commissioner Davis questioned if the driveway would affect the stone drain. Mr. Klesse stated he will leave the stone drain with an asphalt driveway. Mr. Klesse agreed to add six feet of Belgium Block the width of the driveway at the end of the driveway.

Commissioner's Gaylord Sharma expressed concern about the tree. They suggested a professional is consulted.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**April 4, 2019**

Commissioner Sharma asked for clarification of the windows. Mr. Klesse stated they will be a high end window and will be replacing every window in the house.

Commissioner Owolabi questioned the size of the garage door. Mr. Klesse stated it is a 17 foot door appearing to be four door panels allowing more access.

Chair Canfield, referring to the the garage door, stated the door should look like two doors. Mr. Klesse agreed on four foot panels with a 1 foot divider in the middle. Chair Canfield asked for confirmation that it is agreed to follow Forrester Doty's report. Chair Canfield agrees that the circular driveway is feasible.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #431 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Sharma and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
 Mrs. Canfield-Yes
 Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
 Mr. Davis-Yes
 Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
 Mr. Owolabi-Yes
 Mrs. Sharma-Yes
 Mrs. Wanga-Yes

said motion was carried

Application #432: 397 Wyoming Ave.; Block #204, Lot #11; Contributing Property; Wyoming Historic District / Matthew Levine and Natalie Hoitt-Levine – Applicant

Applicant seeks to build a new rear/side addition, demolish existing garage and build a new garage, and other site improvements.

Richard Skolnick, Attorney, Matthew Levine and Natalie Hoitt-Levine, Homeowners, John James, Architect and Brian Hirsch, Landscape Architect were sworn in.

Attorney Skolnick circulated the Municipality Ordinance referring to trees. He stated the roll of the HPC in the tree ordinance. Mr. Skolnick referred to the Federal Fair Housing Act.

Mr. James presented his qualifications.

Referring to the Certificate of Appropriateness Application, current photos of the home were presented by Mr. James as well as the history of the home.

Mr. James stated that the shingle siding, as well as windows and trim details will be matched to the existing house. The addition will be at the rear and right hand side of the house. After taking into consideration the comments from the previous meeting, the windows will remain in their existing location. A flat roof on the rear of the house will remain. The railings were changed to a sunburst design. Additional trim details will remain the same. The grading has been adjusted with a slight incline to the side entry to provide access with a wheelchair.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**April 4, 2019**

The garage will be moved 12.5 feet off the property line, allowing trees to be preserved. The existing driveway entry will be maintained, curving to the side property allowing garage entrance from the front. The garage will have carriage style doors with a turnaround area allowing barrier free access to the house. A small wall at the rear of the house will allow for grading.

The large trees on the property will remain as per Forrester Doty's report. Three trees are being removed due to vulnerability due to the work. Two decorative trees on either side of the turnaround will replace the removed trees.

The front porch was presented with a landscaping buffer.

Floor plans were presented including the basement, first floor with an addition behind it. A laundry room, elevator plan and handicapped bedroom. Leaded glass windows from the dining room will be reused in the bedroom. A bay window in the kitchen will mimic the dining room. The second floor was shown incorporating a closet, a back bedroom will be a master suite with a porch. A master closet window will remain and closet will be larger. The third floor will remain untouched. Mr. James presented elevation plans. Door designs were presented. The rear of the house was presented with the Master Bedroom, sunburst railings, French doors and windows.

Garage drawings were presented. Carriage style doors and a circular window as presented. An access door was shown. The garage will be the same style as the house.

Mr. Owolabi questioned the changes from the last presentation. Mr. James stated the changes.

Mr. Ross stated in his recommendations, a new scheme was presented and changes were made after Forrester Doty's suggestions were given. Mr. Ross noted there is an error on Drawing D03. The existing roof will be patched in as per Mr. James. Mr. Ross stated the garage is in a better location and it maintains the existing trees. Mr. Ross suggests the application is approved with the conditions presented by the Commission.

Commissioner Wanga asked if the plan is to scale. Mr. James confirmed. Commissioner Wanga questioned the historical preference of matching bay windows. Mr. James stated it is common, helping to tie the house together.

Commissioner Davis questioned the size of the garage. Mr. James stated it will remain the same. Commissioner Davis questioned the age of the large tree. Mr. Hirsch stated 80-100 years.

Mrs. Esquivel questioned if the house will remain the same from the front. Mr. James confirmed it will.

Chair Canfield asked for confirmation that the front porch will remain as is. Mr. James confirmed.

Chair Canfield asked what drew them to this house. Mrs. Levine stated they needed a home to accommodate their three children. She was attracted to the sidewalks in the Wyoming Community. She was looking for options for her handicapped child. She always admired the architecture of 397 Wyoming. Specifically, she liked the ability to add on to make the house comfortable for their son.

Commissioner Esquivel commented this is a well thought out plan.

Commissioner Wanga commented while she understands it is necessary, a lot of features are being ruined due to the renovation.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**April 4, 2019**

Commissioner Davis commented while taking into account the Commission's suggestions, he is not comfortable with the tree removal and wishes the trees didn't have to be removed.

Commissioner Gaylord commented that she believes some things shouldn't be taken away, but finds it to be a nice compromise nevertheless.

Chair Canfield stated she feels with the homeowner's statements, she believes they love their home. The Commission's wishes are to restore homes to its original state so they are here long after we are gone. Chair Canfield feels it is a missed opportunity if you don't consider the porch in the plan. It is the piece that needed to be put back. Chair Canfield asked that they consider her plea.

Mr. James stated the porch is not in the location where the previous porch was but can be considered in the future.

Alexandra Parness, resident was sworn in. Mrs. Parness stated she finds removal of the trees irresponsible. She stated that the renovation is not appropriate for the plot of the land as well as the character. The mature trees soften the roof line. The proposed new landscape will remove privacy and will add to traffic noise. She stated this will diminish the quality of life. Doubling the footprint and raising the land will set a dangerous precedent. Mrs. Parness circulated photographs marked as O-1. A satellite view, a neighboring home and a street scape of the neighboring home was presented, referring to removed trees.

John Zeigler, resident was sworn in. Mr. Ziegler, referring to Exhibit O-1, requests that the proposal is rejected. He feels there is no basis on why the garage should be moved. He stated the rear window can be addressed better by the architect and ruins the effect of the house. Referring to page 4, 5 and 6, photographs of numbered trees were shown. The safety of the trees are a concern. Mr. Ziegler stated due to the ordinances, the Commission is not bound to remove the trees. Mr. Ziegler quoted the Penn State Guide to Preserving Trees in Development Projects marked O-2.

Mr. Ziegler proposed issues with a foundation, damaging an ash tree as well as the garage damaging a Norway Maple. Mr. Ziegler stated that two spruce trees planted under a maple tree will surely die.

Chair Canfield asked if Mr. Ziegler received Forrester Doty's report. She asked Attorney Brewer to explain where the Commission stands on tree removal. Chair Canfield stated while she understands where Mr. Ziegler is coming from, the Commission is bound by law. The Commission can only make suggestions and considerations. Mr. Ziegler was given a copy of Forrester Doty's report by the HPC Secretary.

Mr. Brewer explained in detail the HPC jurisdiction.

Referring to the side and rear elevations, Mr. Ziegler stated that due to the addition, the rear window will be lost and shaded. Mr. Ziegler, referred to page 8 in the Penn State Guide in detail. He proposed an extension to the side of the house and not the back. The addition in the rear will be hidden and only seen by the rear neighbors. A front addition will be more honest. A proposed sketch was presented on page 9.

Mr. Hirsch presented a view of the property and presented trees that will be preserved. Types of trees were discussed. Mr. Hirsch stated privacy is important to the homeowners as well. Mr. Hirsch stated that the homeowner has treated the ash tree over the last 8 years which has been succumbed to disease. The Oak trees closest to the house did not exist when the house was built. Mr. Hirsch,

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**April 4, 2019**

referring to the plans, stated that much of the renovations do not affect the trees. Mr. Ziegler stated they went through great care to ensure the drip line was considered and being worked around.

Attorney Skolnick requested to cross examine Mr. Ziegler. Mr. Skolnick, referring to Exhibit A-1, asked Mr. Ziegler to recite wording in an email stating that they had no issue with the proposed plans.

Mr. Ziegler asked Mr. Hirsch if permits would be required. Mr. Hirsch stated Forrester Doty, in his memo, suggested no trees require permits. Mr. Hirsch, referring to a TPZ Zone, stated when working on a tight sight everything has to be executed perfectly. Mr. Hirsch intends to write a letter to an outside company to have proper protection of the trees during construction. Mr. Ziegler requested from the Commission that Mr. Hirsch's protection plan be added to the Resolution.

Sharon Riva, resident of 393 Wyoming Avenue was sworn in. Mrs. Riva stated that they fully support the Levine's. She believes the results will be beneficial to the community. She feels the landscape plan has been successfully achieved. She believes the plans have taken into account the last meetings discussion in great detail.

Pam Solomon, resident of 401 Wyoming Avenue was sworn in. Mrs. Solomon stated the Levine's took into consideration all of the suggestions from the previous meeting. Plans and changes were shared with neighbors and those around them affected were considered.

Jeffrey Bisig, resident of 140 Sagamore Road was sworn in and supports the Levine's proposal.

Stefani Cohen, resident of 25 Farview Road was sworn in. Mrs. Cohen stated that she supports the Levine's proposal.

Grace Ann Bisig, resident of 140 Sagamore Road was sworn in. While not always thrilled with construction in the area of other homes, she feels the Levine's proposal fits with the neighborhood.

Andrea Spaar, resident of 84 Cedar was sworn in. Mrs. Spaar stated that the Levine's went out of their way to accommodate their neighbors.

Andrea Cannon, resident of 29 Bailey Road was sworn in. Mrs. Cannon stated that she supports the Levine's decision. Mrs. Cannon stated preserving the history of the house as well as the trees is important to them.

Jason Cohen, resident of 25 Farview Road was sworn in. He supports the Levine's decision. Mr. Cohen stated it was clearly proven that this is a family who carefully deliberated over every decision to care for their special needs child.

Daniel Cannon, resident of 29 Bailey was sworn in. Mr. Cannon stated when we talk about history, we talk about family and how a tree blooms and blossoms. We can't rebuild our childhood or our families.

Chair Canfield thanked everyone for coming forward and expressing their feelings. The HPC decision making is about the home, the neighborhood and to have directed the Levine's on this special house.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Gaylord to approve Application #432 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with a roll call vote as follows:

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

April 4, 2019

Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Davis-Yes
Mrs. Gaylord-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mr. Owolabi-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Minor Work Review Committee (MWRC)-Mr. Ross stated it is going smoothly.

Education & Outreach Committee-Commissioner Frenkel proposed work is done with the Historical Society and the Commission helps with funding them. Commissioner Frenkel presented a book on the history of interesting homes what will be obtained by a \$250 donation. This will help as a marketing tool to realtors. Chair Canfield stated this is can also be used as an educational piece.

Chair Canfield thanked Attorney Brewer for his training.

Chair Canfield stated that Code Enforcement has been brought into the HPC to ensure the Resolutions are followed.

A comprehensive list of Designated and Non designated sites are being created through the Township.

Chair Canfield stated the new application process for board members has been approved by the mayor and an interview process will be established.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Chair Canfield introduced Lynn Ranieri of the Historical Society. Mrs. Ranieri circulated a newsletter. Mrs. Ranieri explained the mission of the Historical Society as well as her educational background. The Facebook page as well as website was shown. A digital and print newsletter was shown. Events at the museum were briefly discussed. Historical pictures of artifacts, businesses, schools, churches, and town buildings were shown as well as resident's homes and maps.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further suggestions or comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned with a motion from Chair Canfield seconded by Commissioner Gaylord and with unanimous voice vote, meeting was adjourned at 10:26pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole Verducci, HPC Secretary

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

April 4, 2019

The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is May 2, 2019