



THE TOWNSHIP OF MILLBURN

375 MILLBURN AVENUE
MILLBURN, NEW JERSEY 07041

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was held on, July 1, 2021 at 7:30P.M. via Zoom.

Nicole Dante, Secretary, opened the meeting by reading Section 5 of The Open Public Meeting Act, Chapter 231, Public Law 1975.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Mrs. Canfield, Mr. Frenkel, Mrs. Wanga, Mr. Nalitt,
Mrs. Sharma, Mr. Kramer, Mrs. Esquivel

ABSENT: Mr. Davis, Mrs. Gaylord

ALSO PRESENT: Attorney Andrew Brewer, Maggie Miggins, HPC Liaison Maggie Miggins, Barton Ross Historical Preservation Consultant and Nicole Dante, Secretary

MEETING MINUTES

Upon a motion by Commissioner Frenkel to approve the minutes of the June 3rd meeting as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Esquivel and with unanimous voice vote, the minutes were approved.

MEMORIALIZATIONS

OLD BUSINESS

Application #491; 52 Linden St.; Block #307, Lot #16; Contributing Property; Wyoming Historic District; David Jacobs/ C.A. Young Architecture – Applicant

Application for demolition of a sunroom; construction of a new two-story addition; construction of a new 1.5-car detached garage; and driveway/other site improvements.

Mr. Jacobs and Mrs. Huang, Applicants along with Carolyn Young, Architect were sworn in.

Based upon the previous feedback, Mrs. Young presented a screen share of the previous elevation drawings and a detached garage was presented. A garage with a raised roof and a slightly steeper pitch was presented in a front and side view. The pitch will still conform with the Zoning Ordinance.

Roof material on the proposed addition was presented with the option of a standing seam metal roof that would be non-reflective or an asphalt shingle roof. Mr. Ross previously suggested a wood shake roof. The applicant does not feel that is a good choice in keeping with the original house. Due to cost issues, the standing seam is preferred and the applicant is looking to the HPC for suggestion.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

July 1, 2021

Historic photographs were presented showing the condition of the original house. Mr. Jacobs spoke of the history of the house that was built in 1912.

Commissioner Wanga, Esquivel and Sharma, as well as Commissioner Nalitt and Kramer all stated that they are happy with the presentation and has no issues with either of the roof materials.

Commissioner Frenkel stated that he prefers the metal roof but is fine with the other materials as well.

Chair Canfield thanked the applicants for the changes and while she is fine with either material, she prefers the metal roof.

It was agreed that the applicant will let Mr. Ross know what roof materials they have chosen and the minor work committee will review it.

With no further questions or comments a motion was requested.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #491 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mr. Kramer-Yes
Mr. Nalitt-Yes

NEW BUSINESS

Application #494; 45 Crescent Pl.; Block #1604, Lot #3; Contributing Property; Short Hills Historic District; William and Marta Colgan/ Rosen Kelly Conway Architecture – Applicant

Application for new porches, a new rear addition, new windows/doors; and other site improvements.

William and Marta Colgan, Applicants along with David Rosen, Architect were sworn in.

Mr. Rosen presented photos of the current structure with a one story garage. Mr. Rosen stated they are proposing to add a second story to the garage with a master bedroom suite with some slight interior configuration. Windows will be replaced due to current deterioration.

A front elevation of the house was presented with a deck to be removed and a side porch will be modified. An existing front porch will connect with the existing side porch as part of the project. A front porch at the entrance will be installed as well.

Mr. Rosen presented historic photos, pointing out existing trees. Upon investigating the front porch and other houses with similar massing, Mr. Rosen presented several types of front porches with different roof types. An aerial view of the house was shown.

A site plan was presented with a series of five trees in the rear. A proposed driveway cutting across the front yard to the front landing with new front steps was proposed.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 1, 2021**

Mr. Rosen presented interior changes including a powder room. Deck railing will be replaced. Additional decking will be extended to the front. Bathroom renovations were presented. Mr. Rosen stated there are no changes to the parameter. Mr. Rosen stated the stone base of the house will remain the same.

Referring to a historic photo, Mr. Rosen stated that the original chimney no longer exists and the fireplace below is capped.

Mr. Ross stated after reviewing the proposal, the improvements they are requesting are appropriate and makes good sense. Mr. Ross agrees a porch in the front of the house is appropriate but needs further investigation of its history.

Commissioner Kramer requested the materials used for the windows. Mr. Rosen stated they will use the existing exterior materials and they will remain exactly the same.

Mrs. Sharma asked if variances are required. Mr. Rosen stated there are none. Mrs. Sharma asked if any trees are effected by the development. Mr. Rosen stated they will not be disturbed even with the driveway edition.

Commissioner Esquivel agreed more information was needed for the front porch to be decided upon.

Commissioner Nalitt questioned the advantage of the driveway addition. Mrs. Colgan stated that an easement over the neighbor's driveway causes difficulty understanding what driveway leads where. The current driveway leads you to the garage, which does not bring you through the main entrance of the home.

Commissioner Wanga stated that she does not see evidence that there was a previous porch resembling the proposed. She would need more evidence to find the porch appropriate. Commissioner Wanga stated that the pitch of the roof needs to be shallower.

Chair Canfield asked for clarification as to what will be done first. She agrees more research needs to be done on the porch. Mr. Rosen stated that if nothing is done, the existing side porch remains. Mr. Rosen agreed that if the HPC approves the joining of the roofs around the house, they would not want two different types of roofs and prefers that they are similar. If the front roof is not voted on today, it wouldn't be appropriate to vote on the side roof as well. Chair Canfield stated that while she has no issues with the driveway, she questioned the steps to the front door. Mr. Rosen stated that steps are not shown in 1912 photos but he would like to investigate additional maps and will coordinate with Mr. Ross. Mr. Rosen stated that the intent would be to put steps in front the of an existing stone wall. Mr. Ross stated in the original picture, there was a set of stairs. Chair Canfield questioned the windows. Mr. Rosen stated that the existing windows are not original.

Mr. Ross, referring to a historic photo, stated that currently the third floor windows are two over two. In the earliest photo found, the windows were also two over two.

Chair Canfield, as well as the Commissioners, agree the driveway decision could be made today but it is suggested that the applicant return once additional investigating is done about the history of the front porch and steps.

Mrs. Colgan agreed it makes sense to coordinate the steps, porch and driveway together. It was agreed to vote upon the garage addition, windows and driveway this evening. Porch additions will be re-presented at a later date upon further investigation.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 1, 2021**

Upon a motion by Commissioner Esquivel to Application #494 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Frenkel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes
Mr. Frenkel-Yes
Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
Mrs. Sharma-Yes
Mrs. Wanga-Yes
Mr. Kramer-Yes
Mr. Nalitt-Yes

Application #495; 48 Linden St.; Block #307, Lot #14; Contributing Property; Wyoming Historic District; Estringer Developers, LLC/ Thomas Baio Architect – Applicant

Application for demolition of an existing shed and carport, construction of a new 1-car detached garage; new windows/doors, and driveway/other site improvements.

Robert Singer, Applicant along with Thomas Baio, Architect was sworn in.

Mr. Baio stated that this is a legal non-conforming multifamily historic home being converted to a single family home. Mr. Baio presented a site plan of both the house and garage. A detached garage was proposed as well the restoration of a current deck. A car port will be demolished. Re-paving of the driveway was proposed as well as the rebuilding of a front porch.

The existing two family home with an unfinished basement was presented with the exiting demolition. The rear of the house will have an open floor plan. The chimney will remain but the fireplaces will be removed. The current dining room will remain. A passage way and mudroom and powder room was introduced which was previously a closed closet. A second floor plan was presented adding a second floor laundry room. Two current rear rooms, including the second kitchen will become a master suite. The attic will remain an open space to be used as a common recreation area. A bathroom and full bedroom was presented in the front of the house.

The front elevation was presented along with new windows of a six over six mutton pattern. A side elevation shows the removal of one window. The windows will be of legal egress size allowing for larger sashes. Trim boards will be replaced to match the siding materials of the current house. The house will be painted Boothbay Gray with a Snow White trim matching the window color.

A photo of the front of the house was presented emphasizing the windows with the intent of illustrating the nature of the home.

The garage placement was shown in the rear yard as to not compete with the deck. The garage is a one story structure. The garage door will be carriage style with siding and trim to match the home. This is designed as an accessory use garage.

Mr. Ross stated that the proposal, through numerous revisions have made good improvements. The windows are a big improvement. A historic photo could not be found but it was determined there were no shutters on the original house. Mr. Ross stated that it is up to the Commissioners to agree on the egress windows. Mr. Ross feels the Treks decking is not an issue. The shed in the back is not historic. Mr. Ross stated that half round gutters are suggested.

Mrs. Sharma stated that she is pleased that they are making it a single family home. Mrs. Sharma asked for driveway details. Mr. Baio stated the driveway will veer toward the rear yard in the direction of the garage allowing for backing out and pulling straight in. The placement is in order to not have the garage serve as a wall.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES**July 1, 2021**

Commissioner Kramer questioned the placement of the garage. Mr. Baio stated that Millburn does not have a quadrant rule. He would like to keep it as close as possible to keep the impervious coverage down.

Commissioner Esquivel questioned if the front of the house is appearing the same as it currently stands. Mr. Baio presented comparisons of the proposed and new house and pointed out the similarities of the windows. Commissioner Esquivel asked if historical photos exist. Mr. Ross stated they found old maps and historic real estate photos from the 1970's as well as a similar twin across the street.

Commissioner Nalitt asked if the house is vacant. Mr. Singer stated the house is vacant. The apartments are on separate floors.

Commissioner Wanga stated that the market is strong for single family houses and likes the propose plan.

Chair Canfield stated she prefers half round gutters. Mr. Singer agreed. Chair Canfield stated that after Mr. Ross's investigation, a full porch is believed to have existed. Chair Canfield asked that in the future, if you are restoring, we won't hold you to the original standard but it is preferred. Chair Canfield requested a landscaping plan in the future.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wanga to approve Application #495 as submitted, seconded by Commissioner Esquivel and with a roll call vote as follows:

Mrs. Canfield-Yes
 Mr. Frenkel-Yes
 Mrs. Esquivel-Yes
 Mrs. Sharma-Yes
 Mrs. Wanga-Yes
 Mr. Kramer-Yes
 Mr. Nalitt-Yes

Acceptance of the Short Hills Historic District Survey (2021 revision) will be carried over to September.

DISCUSSION ITEMS**Short Hills Survey**

Mr. Ross stated that the Short Hills Survey has been held up by the state due to changing the history from the 1880's to WW2 and have not been signed off on. Mr. Ross stated this is just a recommendation. The cutoff date is still 1920 and he only suggested an expansion. Chair Canfield will share with the commission the verbiage that needs to be changed. Comments from the Commission will be helpful.

Short Hills Village District

The Draft of the Short Hills Village Historic District is available for review. Mr. Ross asked for comments from the Commission.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

July 1, 2021

Downtown Survey

The Downtown Survey is in the works. We are waiting for the Planning Board to be adopted with a subcommittee. Chair Canfield stated she is working with HPC Liaison Maggie Miggins. The HPC has not presented designations or a revised version of the master plan. The procedure is to have a subcommittee. A meeting will be held next week to review the plan with other committees and move the pieces forward.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further comments from the Commission, the meeting was adjourned with a motion from Chair Canfield seconded by Commissioner Wanga and with unanimous voice vote; the meeting was adjourned at 9:52 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole Dante, HPC Secretary

The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is August 5, 2021